LIBRARY COPY

THE ARYAN PATH

Point out the "Way"—however dimly, and lost among the host—as does the evening star to those who tread their path in darkness.
—The Voice of the Silence

VOL. XXIV MAY 1953 No. 5

"THUS HAVE I HEARD"—

102

The ideal which every Sage-Teacher has held before the mental eye of his disciples, as a model for their copying, is high. To be noble not only in aspiration but also in achievement. To be strenuous in the sustained service of all souls. To immolate the self of matter on the altar of the Supreme Spirit. To give light to the ignorant; to nourish the starving; to love the poverty-stricken. To help the mind of man even more than to nourish his body; to awaken the intuition of the heart even more than to educate the mind. To see the One Self in every form of life and to act, as far as in one lies, as that One Self.

To the common man these instructions should make a particular appeal. Today a very large number of men and women are aspiring to work at self-improvement, to gain Soul-light, to feel and to express peace, calm and inner strength.

In exhorting their disciples, different teachers have used different images. Concrete images convey greater instruction and deeper inspiration than do abstract formulæ. Thus, the Enlightened Gautama used many images to appeal to his Bhikkhus; among them, the image of the Lamp. "Be ye lamps unto yourselves, O Bhikkhus; work out your salvation with diligence!" The great Shankara may also be cited and the *Gita* is full of precious images used by Krishna, the Master of Yoga. Even casual reading stirs the mind and in not a few hearts one or another image awakens the slumbering Soul-energy. The stirring of the mind, however, is rarely sustained and the heart energy aroused subsides, often and often, into a vague feeling of pining "for what is not." It is necessary for the mundane mind to revert to the images of abstractions which stir and energize the consciousness.

Let us, as an example, consider four images which the Christian Master used in his grand Sermon on the Mount. In Matthew (V: 13-16) we find:—

Ye are the salt of the earth: but if the salt have lost his savour, wherewith

shall it be salted? It is thenceforth good for nothing, but to be cast out, and to be trodden under foot of men.

Ye are the light of the world. A city that is set on an hill cannot be hid.

Neither do men light a candle, and put it under a bushel, but on a candlestick; and it giveth light unto all that are in the house.

Let your light so shine before men, that they may see your good works, and glorify your Father which is in heaven.

Jesus describes his disciples as "the salt of the earth." To life, drab and sordid, they, by receiving the knowledge which he imparted, gave savour—taste, appreciation, zest. Also, salt is preservative and they preserved their Master's wisdom. Again, in ancient thought salt and incense went together—salt which preserved and immortalized the Soul's wisdom and the incense of the teachings which wafted fragrance for the benefit of men and Gods. "Bread and salt" is a common phrase and represents a universal symbol; offerings were made of them on sacred occasions. So, when Jesus describes his disciples as "salt," he wants them to give real savour to life by preserving within themselves the knowledge and offering it in faith and generosity. In each man the real preserver is the Soul and to express its savour is to speak as the Soul. In his Epistle to the Colossians Paul wrote:—

Let your speech be alway with grace, seasoned with salt, that ye may know how ye ought to answer every man. (IV: 6)

In the Gospel according to Luke (XIV: 34-35) we find Jesus saying:—

Salt is good: but if the salt have lost his savour, wherewith shall it be seasoned?

It is neither fit for the land, nor yet for the dunghill; but men cast it out. He that hath ears to hear, let him hear.

Can a disciple lose his "savour"? Yes, he can, by faithlessness to his instructions and to his discipline. He cannot be absorbed by the masses of good men, and even for a "dunghill" he may become unfit. In speaking in parables Jesus knew that his followers could comprehend the real import of his statements and so he reminds them to give their heart attention to this parable: "He that hath ears to hear, let him hear."

The limits of allotted space have been reached. The other images remain to be dealt with on another occasion.

SHRAVAKA

THE UNITED LODGE OF THEOSOPHISTS,
"Maitri-Bhavan"
15, Sir Krishna Rao Road,
Basavangudi Bangalore City.

THE VISIONARY LANDSCAPE

INDO-EUROPEAN IMAGERY AND SYMBOLISM IN WESTERN LANDSCAPE ART

[**Mrs. Hannah Closs,** the first part of whose interesting essay we publish here, is a historical novelist, the author of *High Are the Mountains* and *And Sombre the Valleys,* the first two novels of a trilogy on the Albigenses, of whose tragic struggle for spiritual freedom she told in our June 1951 issue. Mrs. Closs is keenly interested in seeking the links between Eastern and Western mystic thought, as readers of her earlier article, "The Meeting of the Waters," will recall. In that article, published in our May and June 1948 numbers, she inquired into the interrelationships of East and West in the mystery of the Grail.—ED.]

I

In a recent essay on "Death and the Baroque," Mr. Aldous Huxley expressed the regret that "medieval artists of Christendom painted *mere backgrounds,* whereas those of the Far East painted landscapes that are the equivalent of mystical poetry—formally perfect renderings of man's experience of being related to the Order of Things."

At first sight his criticism may well seem justified. For the Chinese artist it was customary, or at any rate considered recommendable, to go, as it were, into retreat amidst the wilderness, that, rapt in contemplation before mountain lake and stream, he might apprehend the nature of their being and, losing himself in that mystery, feel sweep through him the Divine Energy of the Life-Spirit itself.

A perfect example of this attitude may be seen in the Chinese painting of summer by the Emperor Hui Tsung.

Measured against such pantheistic vision, through which all objects, living or inanimate, are subjugated to an unbroken rhythmic continuity of form, not only the "mere backgrounds" as Mr. Huxley calls them, of mediæval European paintings, but equally the fully developed landscapes of later periods themselves, may at first seem pitifully concrete—either a conglomeration of naturalistic detail, or an arrogantly romanticized or heroicized projection of rationalized human consciousness, if indeed the landscape has not been relegated to the place of a mere foil to the representation of self-glorious man.

But is the comparison itself completely justified? We are not Buddhists or Taoists and few of us have practised, or even set before us as Ideal, an Oriental receptivity. True, many European mystics, finding a common root in what has been termed the Perennial Philosophy,

reflect in their thoughts and visions a close affinity with those of the East; but their pantheistic trend of mind stood almost in contrast to the theistic attitude of Christian orthodoxy and in the eyes of the Church almost amounted to heresy, whilst for the Oriental pantheism was an acknowledged factor of the established order, and hence, in a sense, of the social community itself. The Chinese nature-poet and artist may therefore incline more easily to true mysticism, whilst retaining a place in society, than his counterpart in the West, in whom a pantheistic attitude often tends to go hand in hand with an individualism that can amount even to rebellion and stand in actual opposition to society, orthodox religion, or the State. That blend of detachment and sophistication typical of the Chinese is not likely to be characteristic of the European genius. Nevertheless the latter betrays a fervent apprehension of the mysteries of the Infinite.

Did not England and Germany in particular give birth in the so-called Romantic age to nature poetry that is filled with pantheistic rapture? We need only think of Shelley, the reveries of Wordsworth, the impassioned inner landscapes of Hölderlin —visions to which no Chinese lyric, exquisitely subtle though it be, has, I think, attained.

Is it not the equivalent of such poetry which we should seek in Western landscape art rather than the complete detachment that is the possession of the Oriental? The latter we can scarcely hope to find, for the European artist, like the poet, is himself far more subjective than his Eastern counterpart. In the mind of the Westerner, the apprehension of a unity behind the chaos of appearances is fraught with greater difficulty than in the Oriental who regards reality as a semblance. None the less I would suggest that European art too has given rise to landscapes that can be called, if not directly mystic, essentially symbolic or *visionary*. They belong to a large extent, though not exclusively, to Northern Europe, more particularly to Germany, and the fact that for long ages they enjoyed so little recognition was due not only, I think, to the tyranny exercised by humanism and the Italian Renaissance ideals, but to the failure, even amongst Germans themselves, to seek in them the unrealistic *transcendental* quality that removes them from the pale of the anthropomorphic representative art so typical of Southern Europe, and even suggests at times, in spite of fundamental differences, a *peculiar affinity with the East.*

But let us for the moment turn to something much nearer at hand—an English work of the 19th century which at first sight calls up thoughts of Arcadian idylls, set in the English rural scene. It is a pastoral by Samuel Palmer. A fervent admirer of William Blake, and profoundly religious, Palmer spent some time in the Kentish wilderness of Shoreham, "living into" the landscape

with a mystic devotion that would have satisfied the Chinese.

Speaking of his landscapes, Mr. Geoffrey Grigson has said :

> ...for Palmer as for Blake, a shepherd was not merely pastoral or Virgilian. Palmer's shepherds are the shepherds of *Pilgrim's Progress*, shepherds in the Delectable Mountains with their gardens and orchards and vineyards and streams—the mountains from which the Celestial City was visible.

What are such landscapes, we may ask, but a form of Earthly Paradise —" an Enchanted Ground," as Bunyan himself calls it—where the pilgrim may find solace for a season, to the murmur of the river and the continual singing of birds, in the country of Beulah where the sun shineth day and night, for it lies on the Borders of Heaven. Here, as in the woods of Sir Philip Sidney's Arcady :—

> No treason is hid, veiled in innocence :
> Nor envy's snaky eye finds any harbour here.

Amidst the frigid environment of a neo-classical architecture, sandwitched between the triumphs of dawning Realism and the frivolities of the Rococo style, Palmer's passionate visionary apprehension of nature, lit by his incandescent moons, his glades and fields and mountains, his trees looming as portentous as Yggdrasil, seem almost unique—though to us today they may find affinity in the works of such painters as Mr. John Piper and Mr. Graham Sutherland.

Nevertheless I am inclined to believe that Palmer, in turning his back on the rationalized panoramas of 17th and 18th century landscape painting, was actually expressing, though in a highly individual manner, an attitude to landscape that is the outcome of a long, possibly unconscious, tradition. Further, I would suggest that in doing so he made use of images which, combining in ever new and highly divergent patterns, have their roots in a dream that has haunted the mind of man for centuries, even for thousands of years, namely, man's yearning for the infinite and his dream of Paradise.

How often we find that dream expressed in countless forms in poetry and literature, now as a blissful Arcady, now as a realm of eternal, ageless joys (the Land of Youth met with so often in Celtic myth and faery-tale), or as a state of immortal existence ! The boundaries between spiritual and sensuous are strangely confused. But for all its diversity of form, one factor remains basic and constant, namely, the idea of a realm somehow remote, cut off from this visible world. It possesses a sensuous beauty familiar to our earth, but a beauty infinitely enhanced and sublimated. It wears the forms, the images familiar to us, but they have the quality, not of actuality but of symbol and dream. In short, this idyllic Paradise reflects not an outer but an *inner* world.

Let us, for a moment, consider the idea of Paradise from the point of view of religion which has, after all, exerted a fundamental influence

on art. In the minds of most of us it is inevitably linked with some image of the Garden of Eden, the Creation and home of Adam and Eve before the Fall, and there arises before our mind the concept of a green and fertile glade, spangled with flowers, watered by streams and shaded by leafy trees, such as is represented in a picture of Paradise by Lukas Cranach, a German painter of the early 16th century. Only in his innocent state may man walk in this Paradise through which blows the Breath of God. None the less the Old Testament is overshadowed by the image of the tyrannical and vengeful Jehovah.

It is in Mazdaism—the ancient religion of Central Asia, once known as the cradle of the Indo-European race, a religion traceable only in its later developments in Iran, that we may discover a still purer example of the idea of nature as permeated by the Divine Spirit, the *Chwarna* —the radiance of God.

Of the *Chwarna* it is written in the Mazdaian Bible, the *Avesta* :—

> It appears now as a bird, now as a creature swimming or diving, as a ram or in the form of some other beast, or it passes over into the milk of a cow. *Chwarna* causes the streams to gush from the springs, plants to sprout from the earth, winds to blow the clouds, men to be born. It guides the moon and stars on their path.

In art, such a concept allows of no naturalistic treatment. Nature is expressed in symbols—leaf and fruit, bird and beast, above all water —the gushing stream or spring, the Fountain of Life, holy to all those who dwell in desert or steppe, though not to them alone. Numberless legends known to us since childhood will recall in one form or another that magical source "for ever spending never spent." But what if through some terrible fatality that source fail, the spring dry up? We need but think of the fearful desolation, the curse that fell on all the land in the legend of the Grail—a concept that finds so poignant an echo in Mr. T. S. Eliot's *Waste Land*:

> Here is no water but only rock
> Rock and no water and the sandy road.

The concept of the Fountain of Life recurs continually in the early Christian art of the East. Just as Christianity absorbed so much of Mithraism and the Greek and Egyptian religions, it is permeated with Mazdaian symbolism. A 13th-century carving from St. Mark's, Venice, represents but one of the many similar examples of fountain, bird and vine found in early Christian art. For the vine, symbol of fertility, entwined with the fountain, is a formalized variant of the tree of life with water springing from its roots.

Now let us turn to a specimen of Western mediæval painting—a 14th-century Flemish MS. illustrating Marco Polo's history of his voyage, the "*livre de merveilles.*" Here we see a fountain from which flow the four waters of Paradise, bounding mountainous peaks—the four quarters of the world. Significantly, as

we shall see later, the fountain feeding the rivers of life stands within an enclosure. The paradisal realm is cut off from the actual world by the encompassing seas. Marco Polo's voyage naturally suggests Oriental influence but we need only think of Celtic legend to see how completely such a concept belongs *also* to the West. Is it not in fact a symbol of that Other World, that Avalon to which Arthur or Tristan or Guigemer, wounded unto death, are borne in a magic ship or a rudderless boat across unknown seas?

But clearest of all perhaps is the direct reflection this picture seems to give of the images that appear in the "Harrowing of Annwn," the Welsh poem that suggests primitive concepts of the Grail:—

> Perfect is my seat in Kaer Siddi
> Nor plague nor age harms him who dwells therein....
> And around its corners are ocean's currents
> And the fruitful wonder-working spring is above it,
> Sweeter than wine the drink in it.

Mediæval French romances, such as the *Perlesvaus* (a version of the Grail legend), give a similar image of the heroes who, crossing vast seas, reach an island with a castle, a beautiful tree and a wondrous fountain.

Does not such symbolism clearly remind us of this 14th-century illumination? We have so far met with the image of fountain, mountain and tree, the concept of a holy or magic enclosure. We must not necessarily expect to find all these images united in one and the same picture.

Of symbolic *mountains*, bounded by the seas, we find many examples in Eastern art where they appear, as for instance, in a bronze mirror of Buddhist Japan, in the Todajd monastery at Nara, as the magic mountain of the world — Mt. Meru—on which is situated, it is said, the *Garden of Paradise*. In one variant of these mirrors we see even a boat with a solitary fisher—echo of the Fisher King of the Grail.

Of the symbolic tree, an Indian miniature painting of the Moghul period[1] offers a marvellous example. The tree is here a gigantic rosebush. (We shall refer to the significance of the rose in European painting a little later.) From its roots spring two streams from which a pair of animals drink. In the mountainous distance is a city; above the tree hover two cocks—symbols of the triumphant dawn that lightens the sky. How often was the dawn to play a part in Christian art, from Byzantine mosaics in Ravenna to Dürer's altarpiece of the Holy Trinity! To quote once more the words of the Mazdaian *Avesta*:—

> At the flaming of the dawn, when the gates of heaven are thrown wide... the Saviour rises out of the far East, the fount and habitation of Light.

But, keeping for the moment to the tree, let us recall too the significance of Yggdrasil, the World Tree

[1] See J. Strzygowski: *Durev und der nordische Schicksalshain.* (Heidelberg, 1937, p. 50, plate 41.)

of Nordic mythology growing in Mitgard—that mid-region between Utgard, the outer world, and Asgard, the celestial realm of the gods—Yggdrasil, at whose roots the coiling serpent gnaws. I cannot look on those gigantic, almost demonic trees of Samuel Palmer's, with their writhing snakelike roots, without feeling that they were inspired not only by a perception of actual nature or a sense of æsthetic form but by the unconscious rising up of those incalculable images that lie hidden in the communal memory of the Indo-European race.

In Persian art, which so often reflects rather a courtly version of Mazdaian concepts than the tenets of Mohammedanism, the tree, situated in a paradisal landscape inhabited by animal creatures, is a common phenomenon, nowhere more exquisitely embodied perhaps than in those carpets whose significance can only be perfectly understood if we regard them not merely as wonderful decorations, or as illustrations of the chase but as manifestations of the all-pervading spirit of *Chwarna*.

Through Sufism (a heresy of Mohammedanism), the old Mazdaian and Indo-European concepts were inwoven into courtly Persian poetry and art. The remote Paradise is reflected in the walled or trellised garden of Love in which lover and beloved indulge in an amorous mysticism amongst flowers and trees. Frequently in these enclosed gardens there is a cistern of water.

Is it pure chance that a late mediæval example of the Christian Garden of Paradise by an artist of the Upper Rhine should suggest so striking a parallel to Persian Sufi art? Brilliant in colour, this little painting of the *Paradiesgärtlein* in Frankfurt reminds us of a large-scale European miniature from a Persian manuscript. For here also is the courtly element, the mystic-erotic setting where, in a walled garden, Mary is surrounded by strangely fashionable saints and angels who make music and converse, whilst one of her bower maidens fetches water from a cistern. Of course, we must never forget that, whilst I suggest that such a picture reflects Eastern symbolism, it at the same time marks a growing interest in naturalistic phenomena which is not only the outcome of Nominalist philosophy, but even of the teaching of Thomas Aquinas, that God is mirrored in all things. The emergence of Western landscape painting may well be explained also in the light of mediæval Christian influences, but I have time here only to follow my theme and trace older, and we may say archetypal, images.

How extraordinary was their persistence is revealed, for instance, by the "*Concert Champêtre*" reputedly by Giorgione. Here, at first sight, all mediæval symbolism has yielded to the consummate representation of human form. May it not dawn on one with surprise that we are once more faced with similar images to those we met with in the Paradisal Garden of Love? Only now,

in the Italian Renaissance, the figure fetching water is in classic nudity as indeed the Paradise has been translated into the idyll, nor is there need any longer for the visible boundary to guard this Arcady in which the fashionable youth of Venice has found a refuge from the world. The magic circle has been created by the power of music and by the mood of the landscape itself.

Lack of space prevents me from discussing the question of the idyll as a whole and from inquiring whether the escapist "Arcadies" of Hellenistic and Roman civilization are not partly the result of an unconscious "harking back" to ancient Indo-European ideas. Nor can I here consider further paintings by Giorgione such as the *Tempesta* in Venice, which I believe to be visionary or "interior" landscapes. It has been suggested that their mysterious allegorical (I should rather say dream-like) quality, which removes them so far from Italian paintings as a whole, was due to Giorgione's having belonged to secret societies which inculcated esoteric learning from the East. Maybe it was largely because he stood on the boundary of the North, in which as we have already seen and will perceive yet more clearly, the visionary landscape is at home.

Certainly Venice may well have enjoyed direct access to Eastern influence.

HANNAH M. CLOSS

(To be Concluded)

PSYCHE AND NOUS

Research in parapsychology has produced results which challenge time-hallowed assumptions of natural as of psychological science. Some of these were presented by Dr. J. B. Rhine last year at a Unitarian Colloquium on "The Nature of Man." The studies in Extrasensory Perception (ESP) at Duke University and elsewhere had, he affirmed, demonstrated under test conditions the unconscious operation in certain subjects, under favourable circumstances, of a faculty apparently independent of time and space. The results, including the "incontestable and unshakable case for the psychokinetic action of subject upon object," *i.e.*, for the direct influence of mind upon matter, were not to be accounted for by physical operations as physics was understood today. He considered it safe to conclude "that there is something operative in man that transcends physical law, and, therefore by definition, represents spiritual law."

Merely because the lexicographers have blanketed everything incorporeal under the term "spiritual," the parapsychologists need not follow their lead. It blurs the distinction which Indian psychology has wisely drawn between the lower and the higher or superphysical faculties in man, of which the higher lend themselves only to the man of moral elevation and unselfish aim. We agree with *Manas* (U S.A.) which reviews these findings in its March 18th issue, that the faculties so far revealed in the laboratory may better be called "psychic" and the term "spiritual" be reserved for the higher faculties related to wisdom, conscience, intuition, in which the operation of a higher or soul nature can justly be assumed.

COMPARATIVE PHILOSOPHY

[We publish here the second and last part of an article on this important subject by **Mr. Karl H. Potter, M.A.**, who is in India as a Fulbright Scholar, attached to the Andhra University, Waltair. Comparative philosophy has a distinct contribution to make to mutual understanding between peoples, which the American Fulbright Act seeks to promote.—ED.]

II.—NATIONAL COMMON SENSE AND INTERNATIONAL PHILOSOPHY

The direction which the development of common sense takes must be in one sense spontaneous—it cannot be planned out by a committee as if it were a military operation. But that does not mean that we must leave the direction to chance. And what we can do seems to me to be the only proper justification for comparison in philosophy, and a very important one. What we can do, as philosophers, is to enlighten our own common sense by proposing theories—fantastic ones, no doubt—in areas not dealt with in much detail by the central core of our own culture's philosophy. What I mean is this: earlier I cited a suggestion that common sense in Britain and America thinks first about the public good, while that in India worries most about the individual's spiritual welfare. This is a large and debatable generalization, but let us suppose for the moment that it is true. Then, to educate the common sense of these two cultural areas, we shall want to direct the thinking of the West toward spiritual problems and the thinking of India to problems of public welfare. We shall want to bring the philosophers of India to the point where they can offer contributions to the philosophy of science; conversely, philosophers in America and Britain will be offering contributions to theories concerning the spiritual life. If this could be accomplished, we might next find philosophers worrying about the relations between these two areas of study and trying to work out a theory of the connection between the individual spirit and science—both cultures co-operating in this venture, because now they would both feel it to be of the utmost importance. This is not a plan of action, but a hypothesis about what might happen if the horizons of the enlightened common sense of philosophers were to be broadened.

The important point to see is that philosophers are led on by their own interest in each topic as philosophers, not as explorers in odd corners of scholarship. The philosopher must be convinced at each step in his development that a new discovery is related to some problem

which his enlightened common sense *already* feels is important. We cannot, as has sometimes been proposed, stop or slow down the progress of science, or speed up the progress of religion or psychology, so that the philosopher may get a balanced view. Progress will continue; philosophers will go on making fantastic theories, the inevitable reaction to the common sense of the moment will result and common sense will change just as it has always done. To suggest any plan which precludes this natural development is to dream.

But how can we even begin to philosophize in a field where the contributions up to the present have come out of a quite different common-sense basis? Is it not a tremendous demand to make of a philosopher that he enter the field without any background? We cannot philosophize *in abstracto*. And is it really possible for anyone to master theories and attain a background in an area where the assumptions made are quite different from his own?

These questions are of the utmost importance, for they suggest that, in order to study responsibly the areas which are little known to him, the philosopher of one culture must absorb the common sense of another culture. Must the aim of the proposal, then, be assumed to be already achieved before it is carried out? I do not believe the situation is quite so grim. It is true that the more one absorbs the common sense of another culture, the better able will one be to make responsible contributions to the area in which that culture's philosophy is strongest. But I do not believe that the converse is true, that one can make no contributions in another area without completely changing his own common-sense assumptions.

I would take cognizance of the difficulty in another way. I agree that it is not at the outset possible for any one to master theories in an area where the assumptions made are *quite* different from one's own. But I have nowhere said that philosophers should try to change their spots overnight—in fact, the whole point is to achieve the change of one's common sense gradually and, to some extent, painlessly. That's where the comparative philosopher comes in. His job, as I see it, is to interpret the results of the philosophy of Culture A to the philosopher of Culture B in such a manner that B may easily move into new fields of inquiry, fields which carry him out of his own common-sense interests and into those new ones which he will then share with A. This movement must be painless in the sense that B must be able to feel that he is discovering things as he moves along which are giving him insights in terms of his own common-sense beliefs. Incorporating these new discoveries into his beliefs, he then has a new basis upon which to make a further step into the new field, and so forth.

As I suggested, the man who makes this painless transition pos-

sible is the comparative philosopher. And the function here assigned to him, it seems to me, delineates how comparison between the philosophies of different cultures must be carried out for the benefit of philosophers. The comparative scholar must always be relating his discoveries to the common sense of his audience; he serves as a scout to his fellow philosophers and, since the forest is thick, he must never get so far ahead of them that he cannot find his way back. Indeed, not only must he lead them along paths that have perhaps never before been trod, but also he must always be pointing out the landmarks, urging the travellers onward and recommending what lies ahead.

Yet, since a scout is not a guide, in the sense that he too has not necessarily been all the way over the route before, our scholar does not necessarily require an intimate knowledge of the common sense of the other culture. He needs a few rules of thumb, to be sure: he must know the language in which the material to be discovered is to be found and he must be sufficiently acquainted with the general framework of ideas to be able to move among them with some ease. Even with these rules, he may lose the way. His duty, however, is always to his students, and he must produce his comparisons in such a fashion that they find them understandable and illuminating.

A comparative study that is worthwhile from this point of view will not be of the sort that says: So-and-so differs from Plato in the following ways. For, Plato being dead and gone, his philosophy has interest for us only in comparison with our own common sense. We make the following rule, then: A philosophically useful comparison between two sets of ideas must be such that at least one of the sets represents or is clearly related to the common sense of some living culture. The comparison is then addressed to the members of that culture, as a means of introducing them to the facets of thought in the other set of ideas which may tend to make them revaluate their common-sense beliefs and possibly change them. A comparison addressed to ancient Greeks can have only remote usefulness for us.

This means that the techniques of scholarship used in comparative philosophy will be those techniques which are understood by the philosophers of the culture to which the comparison is addressed. As an example, if one wants to compare some portion of Indian philosophy with contemporary thought in America for the benefit of Americans, one should use the techniques of scholarship sanctioned by most American philosophers—a careful study of the semantics and logic underlying the portion of Indian thought being studied, along with an indication of the problems raised and the sorts of answers suggested by the ways in which words and concepts are used in this Indian system.

On the other hand, when American philosophy is being studied for the benefit of the Indian philosopher, it may prove more illuminating to him to point out the broad implications of the doctrines held by American theorists, using language and concepts that are familiar in discussions of Indian philosophy and contrasting those doctrines with parallel schools of thought in India.

The comparative philosopher is a peculiar sort of scholar in that he may not shut himself away in a corner of the library and work his life away on some pet project which he has never bothered to relate to anything else. The comparative scholar owes it to his public to make the fruits of his studies palatable to them and even to abandon a line of inquiry if the results are not of the sort likely to provide illumination to his readers.

Comparative philosophy in this sense is an essential part of the philosophical enterprise, for it holds the promise of an eventual community of philosophers working for a common purpose. It is to the great credit of the philosophers in the universities of India that they have seen the necessity for such a community and have already embarked upon a study of Western common-sense traditions. If and when their researches bear fruit in the form of contributions to Western modes of thought, they will have achieved what most philosophers in the West have shown few signs of interest in so far, namely, the improvement of their common-sense beliefs by enlarging their scope of interest.

KARL H. POTTER

ON VALUES

In "Values in Context," an address delivered last October at the Mount Holyoke Conference on Science and Human Values (*The American Scholar*, Winter 1952-53), Mr. David Riesman challenges the frequent assumption that values in general have in our day been lost or dissipated. Certain values may have been replaced by others, but "men cannot live without values, without preferences and choices."

He does not believe in attempts to impose one's values on others. He implies the need for self-examination as to how far pride of intransigence and exhibitionism are involved in one's championship of the unpopular side of a question.

Mr. Riesman rejects the idea that a consensus on values is necessary to the holding together of a democratic society. "Value-agreement," he implies, could be based only on "choicelessness."

All men can be expected to see alike only when, in the course of evolution, all truth becomes self-evident. Meanwhile it is of the highest importance to human development that each be free to make his own value judgments, combining, perhaps, with Mr. Riesman, conviction on certain issues with a relativist position on others.

Mr. Riesman admits, however, an understandable tendency to become a fanatic crusading against the fanaticism that is directed to destroying in us the psychological roots that would enable us to sympathize with "a possibly liberating voice in the thinkers of the past." There is a special pertinence, in our day of pressure for conformity, in Mr. Riesman's plea for meeting life "flexibly, listening to the ancestor within and the friend without, but not bound to obey either."

THE IDEAL OF THE OPEN SOCIETY

[**Shri M. A. Venkata Rao,** M.A., considers in this thoughtful article the ideal of society which shall best serve the interests of all, invoking support for his ideas not only from ancient Indian philosophy but also from Plato. However little eclecticism and compromise or the middle way of synthesis and mutual adaptation appeal to the fanatic, political or economic, there is little doubt that something of the kind offers the only reasonable way out of the present *impasse* caused by the division of the world into opposite camps.—ED.]

There is a decisive difference between ancient and modern times in regard to the ideal of society. The difference turns on the idea of progress. The psychological climate of early and mediæval society was dominated by the note of stability and equilibrium, in the form either of indefinite continuance of social order at its best or of cycles of civilization with recurring phases of growth, maturity and decay. The Indian view of the social order is indicated by the notion of *dharma*. *Dharma* means a state of society promoting social solidarity, which is achieved by the devotion of individuals and classes to the duties of their respective stations in life. The dominant note in the psychological climate of modern social thought and practice, on the other hand, is not mere health and equilibrium but an expanding order offering to the members of society ever wider opportunities for their betterment.

The idea of progress dominated the thought of the 19th century and permeated all spheres of life and practice, science, philosophy, art and religion. Every invention and advance in technology came in turn to be looked upon as a criterion of progress. Soap, the steam locomotive, the telegraph, the wireless, the modern newspaper, etc., were taken as decisive tests of civilization. Today we find social thinkers turning, after the experience of war and devastation, towards a truer idea of progress. The new line of thought concerning the social ideal is indicated by the concept of the so-called open, as contrasted with that of the so-called closed, society.

The test of the soundness of society is no longer sought in isolated sectors of life, economic, technological, political or cultural, but in the totality of influences operating in any society on its individual members in their several ranks and groups. Though the criterion is twofold : order and advancement, equilibrium and progress, the ideal of the open society envisages the mutual relation of the two aspects in such a way that order and equilibrium are taken up in a vital manner in the process of advancement and progress.

Bergson, in his work, *The Two Sources of Morality and Religion*, sketches the contrast between the

closed and the open types of society in the field of morality and religion. Morality, according to him, appears in the early stages of evolution in the form of pressure and law forcing a certain uniformity in conduct and loyalty, this unanimity being essential for survival in the struggle with nature and other social units. Just as the being is endowed by nature with protective and offensive limbs or organs, so society evolves myths postulating the existence of spirits and gods. Belief in such myths binds the members of society into an effective defensive whole. Such myths are religious. The obligation of the moral law becomes clothed with the myth of common blood or a common allegiance to the same ancestral spirits or gods. While, from the society's own point of view, myth and customary law are inclusive and bind the members into a fraternity, from the external point of view, they are exclusive. The "we group" is distinguished from the "they group" and the sense of obligation is confined to the welfare of the former.

This tribal morality has come to form the core, in modern times, of the religion of nationalism. But there comes a stage in history when the idea of a universal obligation to humanity as such, irrespective of tribe and nation, appears on the spiritual horizon of man. The law of nature in Roman times and the love of God as the Father of all in later days developed the notion of morality and religion as pertaining to man as man. The great mystics break the old narrow shell and introduce man to the ocean of humanity and to a horizon limited by no local Olympus or Meru. The new horizon reveals the true destiny of man to be "clothed with the heavens and crowned with the stars."

The contrast drawn by Bergson between the closed and the open types of religion and morality is applicable to every sphere of life. Much of the conflict between Capitalism and Socialism (or Communism) turns on this distinction, but the controversy has become confused because of the mixing in societies of elements of both types. Feudal economy and polity were largely of the "closed" type. They provided for stability but failed to make room for the betterment of both aristocrats and serfs. Industrialism and the free contract opened the way to a larger life but again only for the few, *viz.*, the class of owners. Society soon came to anchor itself in wealth and inheritance.

The ideal of the open society in industrial organization is not committed either to Capitalism or to Socialism. It does not commit the mistake of 19th-century Liberalism, of identifying itself with *laissez faire* and untrammelled free enterprise. This allowed an open horizon only to the owners of capital but sacrificed the interests of the workers, whose only capital is labour. The new ideal takes into account both the universal principle and the specific situation before pronouncing

judgment on any particular type of economic or political organization. The same major principle or universal truth may have to be applied in different ways in different circumstances to insure the same ultimate conclusion, *viz.*, the realization of well-being. The value of Capitalism at its best has been that it has made possible the development of initiative and of managerial capacity on the part of classes that, under previous regimes, had had fewer opportunities for the liberation of latent faculties. In comparison with the reigns of the Stuarts in England and the Bourbons in France, the new regime of free enterprise functioned for the commercial and industrial interests as an open society. But it did not liberate the peasants and the factory workers.

From this point of view the present Russian regime has had the effect, on large masses of the Russian population, of a great liberating movement. Universal literacy has enlarged the mental horizon of large numbers of the people. But against this beneficent effect must be set the blighting effect of the reigning autocracy, which, in all spheres of life and thought, holds the minds of the people in an iron grip. Art, science and philosophy, music and amusement, family and group life, are all controlled from above. The closed society predominates in Russia over the open one.

In countries favouring free enterprise a similar mixture of the closed and the open society is to be found. The old principle of "career open to talent" indicated in the popular sayings: "Every soldier carries a marshal's baton in his knapsack," and "Every boy born in a log cabin can go to the White House," is no longer applicable to the same degree as before. The majority of working-class people are bound to remain in the economic class in which they are born, and this restriction of economic opportunity entails the closure of many doors to a better life for the vast majority.

In the political sphere too the same history of initial progress and present stagnation is discoverable, even in outwardly democratic countries. The overhead cost of democracy in feeding a large class of ambitious politicians and their supporters, in addition to the necessary cost of the administrative class, with the demands of party patronage complicating the issue, is immense. The sphere of the open door is becoming negligible for most ordinary citizens. This accounts in part for the phenomenal ease with which the Nazi and Fascist dictators seized and maintained power.

The ideal of the open society does not contemplate a mere quantitative summation of social influences on the individual. Every occupation brings man into active contact with nature and his immediate social group. It is the avenue of his freedom and culture. Whether it be tillage or craft, learning or administration, the occupation generates an ethos or a *dharma* of its own. There

is an advantage in this state of affairs; an evil developing in any one sphere will not spread automatically into other spheres of life. It may be met by better ideas in other groups and this will offer a chance of reconstruction.

In modern societies, however, there is a tendency towards uniformity. The ethos of the competitive commercial world is apt to dominate the political and the spiritual and other spheres as well. It influenced Malthus in his theory of population outrunning the means of subsistence and Darwin in his picture of the struggle for existence. It corrupted ethics in Nietsche's theory of the Will to Power transcending morality. Such an ethos of restricted validity will have the effect of closing the mind to better ideas if accepted as supreme and universal, as by dogmatic theology. The idea of the "class of war" in Russia and of racialism, imperialism and plutocracy elsewhere have become the makers of a closed society.

The differentia of the open society is that in it the door to change through reason and persuasion will always be kept open, through a dominant ethos of toleration, faith in reason and good-will. Totalitarianism is the exact opposite of this and is the result of the gangster ethos obtaining supreme power. It is a striking example of what Indian thinkers speak of as *varna sankara* or confusion of vocations. It betokens a simultaneous corruption of the values of money, pleasure, force and law in the ruling group. It closes the door forcibly to reasonable change.

The criterion of the open society is akin to the Indian emphasis on the spiritual quality. Indian civilization judges every value of life and culture in the light of the theory of the three *gunas: sattva, rajas,* and *tamas* (spiritual quality, ambitious activity and action darkened by sense-pleasure, respectively). The *sattvic* ideal demands the sublimation of physical desire and social ambition in the householder stage. In politics and administration it envisages the subordination of power to law and righteousness. In economics it stands for the redemption of wealth through its subordination to morals, from production to consumption.

Every class uses a specific energy with different proportions of spirit, power and appetite but the values of *artha* (wealth) and *kama* (desire) associated with them are subordinated to the ideal of *dharma* to facilitate the emergence of spiritual value. Even in art, the final test is not pleasure but the joy that leaves the contemplator better than before. True beauty and the contemplative enjoyment of it are analogues of the cosmic activity, lifting us to the point of view of the universe.

The criterion of the open society is to be applied in two aspects, the quantitative and the qualitative. The conditions of the good life are to be offered to ever larger numbers of

people. The very process of functioning in the ordinary occupations should lead to such expansion of opportunity. This implies both the creation of surplus capital and the application of it to constructive, liberating avenues of work and play, leisure and education. The eugenic plan of improving the physical endowment is part of the qualitative aspect. The present generation must pay its debt to its forbears by leaving a healthy, strong and gifted progeny with a smaller proportion of the unfit than its own. And it must conserve the resources of nature and pass them on undiminished to its successors. Further, the social heritage, *i.e.*, the sum of thought in the sciences and the crafts, the trades and the industries should be enhanced and passed on fuller than before. These demands of the open society are indicated in the regulations of Manu in his ordinances for man.

If the *varna dharmas* (vocational duties) are taken in the true meaning of vocational stations related to conduct and the character (*karma* and *guna*), and freed from the false notion of *varna* by birth, they lead to gradual and necessary purification of soul and universalisation of outlook. Beyond the social stage is set the stage of *sanyas*, governed by the universal in truth and conduct. The pilgrims of time in family and vocation are led to eternal values in *sanyas*.

The ideal therefore yields a true test for every activity and function. Advertisement, free enterprise, democracy, art, science, religion, etc., are all to be conducted in such a way as to liberate and fulfil the higher self of man, the egoistic being subordinated to the social and the social to the universal. From this point of view, planning and law as such are not opposed to spiritual freedom. All plans and laws must control and direct, but the manner of their direction and control should result in the freeing of the larger and higher self of man. Such a balance between democracy and aristocracy, between economic freedom and regulation, between censorship and freedom in art, etc., as will promote in practice this supreme end is demanded by the ideal of the open society.

From this point of view, it is clear that Plato is, on the whole, on the side of the open society. Enthusiasts for the open society have sometimes classed Plato as its enemy. Of course they have in view his scheme which places the guardians in supreme authority in his ideal republic. While supreme power is in his plan vested in the guardians chosen through a rigorous course of education and responsibility, it must be noted that Plato does not exclude any class of citizens from the educational sieve. All have the same opportunity but the best are chosen. Souls of iron and brass, silver and gold, are found among all classes of citizens. Plato's is therefore more an open than a closed society. But once the rulers, proved to be the wisest

and strongest, are chosen, they are supreme. Their rule is not subject to popular approval but will deserve it by its wisdom. Though this is not formal democracy as understood today, the spirit of Plato's thought is not in favour of a closed society, for the guardians will be making continuous efforts to elicit the best in the people and will afford as much freedom as is necessary for the realization of truth and goodness.

In addition to the free circulation of the *élite*, made possible by the provision for talent, and of careers for all with opportunities for self-expression, the open society is marked by the quality of its leadership. Leadership that is founded on merit and devotion to the public good and tested through long years of experience will be spontaneously accepted by the people.

Thus the concept of the open society includes the elements of value in the ideas of religious or spiritual, free, liberal or progressive societies without the misunderstandings associated with these in current controversy.

M. A. VENKATA RAO

A SILENT REVOLUTION

Under the title "Vinoba Bhave: India's Walking Messiah," Mr. George Weller examines in the Winter 1953 *Yale Review*, not only the technique of "Gandhi's moral heir" in his Land-Gifts Mission, but also the philosophy that underlies this revolution with a difference.

Recognizing an economic revolution for India as inevitable, Shri Vinoba Bhave is leading the way to a non-violent revolution that promises to relieve the pressure for reforms without plunging the country into strife. Those advocating violent revolution, he holds, seek only an exchange of places between the now happy and unhappy ones. To his mind, "a revolution must signify universal happiness without exception." He justifies this as in harmony with the spirit of India.

> While the Western mind is trained to think in terms of the greatest good of the greatest number, the Indian mind from childhood is taught to think in terms of the good of all.

Against the Communist technique of creating dissension, Shri Vinoba Bhave sets the ideal of building the people "into an integrated community of love."

The acreage figures of donated land legally transferred to landless cultivators testify to his persuasiveness with landlords. To the sharecroppers he preaches self-help. His own disciplined and dedicated life and his complete disinterestedness lend to his counsel a tenfold force. Mr. Weller had heard reluctant landlords in Uttar Pradesh, finally capitulating, explain: "We cannot actually spare you an inch of land. But because you are a mahatma, we cannot let you leave us empty-handed."

> Yet Vinoba somehow leaves the farmers with a sense of having solved their own troubles, respectably and independently. The rich, because they have given "voluntarily," are ennobled and dignified. The poor have a divided gratitude—to the departed Vinoba, to the remaining rich, and to God, whom Vinoba summons to witness and sanctify the gift.

The demonstrated success of Shri Vinoba Bhave's appeal to voluntary sacrifice in the name of human brotherhood seems to point to a middle way between Communism and capitalism for ironing out the inequalities, within and between nations, which threaten the peace of the world.

Only the other day a committee was appointed under the chairmanship of Dr. Radhakrishnan to give official support to the movement inaugurated by Vinoba Bhave.

SCOTTISH SECOND SIGHT

[The subject of "second sight," on which **Mr. E. R. Yarham, F.R.G.S.,** writes here, has been brought to special notice in our day by the students of extra-sensory perception. There are, however, instances of it even in Homer's *Odyssey*. The writer has drawn freely in this compilation from the writings of Andrew Lang and others. Obviously, as Mr. Yarham brings out, it is no monopoly of the Scottish people. Nor can it properly be described as "supernatural," though it is supernormal; for it is superphysical or psychic vision, a faculty latent in each human being though displayed in our day only by those in whom the inner sense called intuition has been to some extent developed. Precognition is involved also in warning or prophetic dreams. The understanding of precognition of either type seems to demand the positing of a supersensuous medium on which, as on a photographic plate, are registered not only past and present happenings but also adumbrations of events whose causes are already sufficiently well marked and made—a record open in some measure to the inner sense of those possessed of "second sight."—Ed.]

We hear a lot about ordinary sight, how about second sight, so-called?

Premonitions and second sight are psychical phenomena which are far more frequent than people imagine, although very often those who experience them are shy of confessing their experiences for fear of ridicule. It was once widely believed, too, in Scotland that if a person revealed what he saw before the event there was a danger of his losing the faculty of seeing into the future.

Scotland has always been a land famous for second sight, but the gift is by no means confined to the Celts. It seems commoner among some races than others. Included in those which have provided astonishing examples of second sight are the Maoris and the Red Indians, the Zulus and the Lapps, peoples widely different in character and whose homes are separated by thousands of miles. Readers of books of travel and exploration will often come across records of second sight set down by the writers who were astonished by them.

The Scottish people were already celebrated 500 years ago for their gift of second sight. In his history known as the *Polychronicon* the English chronicler Ranulf Higdon (a Benedictine monk of the monastery of St. Werburg in Chester, where he died about 1363) describes Scottish second sight, adding that "strangers setten their feet upon the feet of the men of that londe for to see such syghtes as the men of that londe doon." At the close of the 17th century the Rev. Mr. Kirk wrote a treatise (it was later edited by Sir Walter Scott) describing it, and the Rev. Mr. Fraser, Dean of

the Isles, early in the next century commented upon it scientifically. Martin's *Description of the Western Islands* (1703-16) gives a minute account of the gift, and Theophilus Insulanus (1761) wrote a celebrated treatise on it.

Dean Fraser remarked that he had found the faculty existing in all parts of Scotland but that in the more civilized (if one may put it so) south and Lowlands he found people would not talk about their "visions" lest they should be laughed at. Martin speaks of the power as the singular faculty of seeing an otherwise invisible object without the person that sees it using any means for that end. He said that the vision made such an impression upon the seers that they neither saw nor thought of anything else except the vision so long as it continued, and then they appeared thoughtful or happy according to the object represented to them.

He said that even then, 200 years and more ago, although there were many such seers still living, there were not nearly so many of them as there had been. When a vision comes, he said, "the eyelids of the seer are erected, and the eyes continue staring till the object vanishes." He knew of cases in which, when a vision like this came to a seer, the inside part of his eyelids turned so far upwards that the seer had afterwards to draw them down with his fingers, or get somebody else to do so. Occasionally a seer was subject to epileptic fits, but these are by no means a necessary concomitant of the faculty. Andrew Lang, who was much interested in the subject, said that he was told by a Highland minister that his beadle had "the sight" in rich measure. It was "always preceded by a sense of discomfort and anxiety," but was not attended by convulsions. There were seven or eight seers in that particular parish, but only one was not perfectly healthy and temperate.

Theophilus Insulanus instances about 200 cases, recorded in full detail. Many are worth quoting, and one runs:—

There lives at Glenelg a person commonly known by the name of Sergeant, a most remarkable seer, of whom I had many stories from very good authors of his prophetic talent. I will only mention one, which may serve as a sample of the rest, and was delivered to me by Ensign MacLeod[1] who, as he was travelling home under night accompanied by [him], this seer on a sudden desired him to keep to a side, as there was a throng gathering of people coming on the direct path of the road, carrying a corpse on a litter. The ensign having told him that he had no faith in such discoveries, the seer replied the vision in a short time would be fulfilled, and that the ensign himself would be one of the company; and then named several from the surrounding counties, distinguishing them by their names, arms and clothing, who were to assist at the interment, and pointed at

[1] Theophilus Insulanus was a MacLeod too.

particular passes where such and such men were to relieve those who carried the bier. In some short time thereafter a gentlewoman that was sister to the ensign departed this life. All the persons foretold were called and assisted at the interment without the least variation from the scene.

Andrew Lang records another notable instance. The Rev. Dr. Stewart, of Nether Lochaber, told him that one of his parishioners, a woman this time, called him to look at a rock by the seashore, which shone with a kind of phosphorescent brilliance. The minister thought this was due to decaying seaweed, but the seer replied, "No, a corpse will be laid there tomorrow." So it proved, for the next day a body was brought in a boat for burial, and was laid at the foot of the rock. Dr. Stewart found there was no decaying vegetable matter there.

As a matter of fact, many Highland ministers in the olden days seem to have been gifted with the faculty. Dr. Kennedy, in a book entitled *The Days of the Fathers in Ross-shire*, records several examples of supernatural vision. There was a notable minister, the Rev. Mr. Lachlan M'Kenzie, of Lochcarron, of whom he wrote that

> a sudden death never occurred in the parish during his ministry, without some intimation of it being given from the pulpit on the previous Sabbath and sometimes warnings would be so strikingly verified that one cannot wonder he was regarded as a prophet by his people.

Another, the Rev. Mr. Kennedy, of Killearnan, was regarded as a seer. Once he said during preaching, "There is one now present who before coming into the meeting was engaged in bargaining about his cattle, regardless of the day and of the eye of the Lord."

Later a farmer said to him, "How did you know that I was selling my heifers yesterday to the drover?"

"Did you do so?"

"I cannot deny it," replied the farmer. "But will you not tell me how you knew it?"

The only reply was in the words of the Scripture: "The secret of the Lord is with him that fear Him."

Several other interesting instances have been recorded by Andrew Lang. One originated in Balachulish, where an old man was troubled by visions of armed men in uniform, drilling in a field near the sea. The uniform was not "England's cruel red," and he foresaw invasion, but "it must be of Americans, for the soldiers do not look like foreigners." Later the Volunteer movement started and the men drilled in the very field. Then, a man was sitting with a boy on the edge of a path in a quarry. Suddenly he jumped aside and dragged the boy with him. He had seen a vision of a runaway trolly with men in it dash down the path, but he could see no traces of them below. The man said in Gaelic, "The spirits of the living are powerful today." The next day a fatal accident occurred at the spot.

The visions frequently pertain to events of that kind or to funerals. In this respect a curious story is told, which seems to point to the fact that in some cases the seer can pass on the vision by physical contact with another person. A woman with the faculty was talking to two men close to her house. She suddenly asked them if they could see candle-lights coming round the corner of a wood a quarter of a mile away. They said, "No." She asked one of them to take her hand and look over her shoulder, when he at once saw the lights. Next she asked the other man to do the same but he refused. Shortly afterwards a funeral passed that way.

Is there any rational explanation of these astonishing phenomena? None that can be pinned down in the form of hard, unemotional fact. Second sight or premonition, this species of involuntary prophetic vision, call it what you will, is as old as the hills and impossible of exact scientific explanation. The examples, however, which point to precognition as a faculty of the human mind are too numerous and too well authenticated to be ignored or explained away.

The late J. W. Dunne's instances —this philosopher was the author of the famous theory of the "serial universe," abstruse but intensely stimulating—and those given in such books as the Hon. Mrs. Edith Lyttelton's *Some Cases of Prediction* are but some of the latest items in a continuing evidence which goes back to Old Testament times. Dr. J. B. Rhine's experiments at Duke University and those of Dr. S. G. Soal at the University of London provide additional corroboration of Mr. Dunne's contention that what Tennyson called "the abysmal deeps of human personality" extend beyond this physical universe of time and space.

The whole subject is bound up with the problem and mystery of what we call "time." In this connection the late eminent scientist, Sir Oliver Lodge, put forward a helpful hypothesis:—

> A luminous and helpful idea is that TIME is but a relative mode of regarding things; we progress through phenomena at a certain definite pace, and this subjective advance we interpret in an objective manner, as if events necessarily happened in this order and at this precise rate. But this may be only our mode of regarding them. The events may be in some sense existent always, both past and future, and it may be we who are arriving at them, not they which are happening.

Certain people with the power to project their mind into the future are perhaps thus able to "see" them long before they happen. Thus Mrs. Osborne Leonard in Britain was able on hundreds of occasions to "see" the front page of the next day's *Times*, and even to quote from advertisements printed there. Even more remarkable was the French sailor, Henri Bottineau, the so-called "Wizard of Mauritius," who lived during the latter half of the 18th

century.

He was Second Harbour-Warden at Mauritius, a post he held for about 20 years, during which time he was able to detect the presence of ships, and to say whether they were bound for the island—even when they were from 200 to 300 miles away! During a period of 14 years, 575 ships arrived at Mauritius. An account of this man's uncanny powers reads thus:—

According to a report by a retired Governor, Bottineau forecast the approach of every one, without fail, while it was still a considerable distance away, and in every case out of sight of the island. There is another report in the despatches from the Vicomte de Souillac to the Minister of Marine, dated 26th May 1782, which states that the same feat was performed over a period of 17 years without a single mistake being noted.

If the ships happened to be sailing in convoy, Henri would state how many were thus sailing together, and frequently he also described the formation in which they were arranged. During part of the time he was stationed on Mauritius, France was at war with Britain and it was hourly expected that a hostile fleet would appear off the island. On one occasion Henri caused deep alarm there by reporting that a fleet of eleven ships was converging on Mauritius. Two days after his first warning he stated that the sailing directions had been changed. He could not say what this meant, but the fleet never appeared off the island.

This event did not react to his advantage. His enemies suggested that he had been discredited, and some people resented the alarm they had suffered. It was even said that there never had been a hostile fleet near the island. That unpleasant situation did not endure for long, because presently a ship from Pondicherry put into Mauritius and reported passing a fleet of eleven ships bound from the Cape to India.[2]

Sir David Brewster, the Scottish scientist, endeavoured to explain these powers as the outcome of "diligent observations of the phenomena of nature," but general opinion is that Bottineau had supernatural powers which enabled him to project his mind both into the future and across space. He enjoyed the ability in a unique form.

E. R. YARHAM

---

[2] W. L. SPEIGHT.

THE RELIGION OF THE LEPCHAS

[**Dr. R. de Nebesky-Wojkowitz,** who writes here of the faith and customs of the Lepchas of Sikkim and neighbouring regions, has for some time been conducting research in the borderland between India and Tibet. A Research Associate of the Museum of Ethnology at Vienna, Dr. de Nebesky-Wojkowitz is recognized as a specialist in Central Asian and Himalayan cultures. He contributed to our November and December 1952 issues an article in two instalments on " Bon—The Pre-Buddhist Religion of Tibet."—ED.]

The Himalayan State of Sikkim is the chief home of the Lepchas, a Mongoloid tribe which numbers about 30,000 today. Nearly 23,000 Lepchas still reside in Sikkim itself, mainly in their reservation at Zongu, while the rest live scattered in a few villages of the neighbouring Darjeeling District, at Ilam in Eastern Nepal and in two valleys of West Bhutan. Increasing contact with racially stronger tribes, especially with vigorous and unscrupulous immigrants from Nepal, has resulted in the Lepchas having gradually lost the greater part of their characteristic tribal culture. Nepalese dress or even apparel of Western style has replaced the colourful old Lepcha costume; their ancient legends and traditions, their melodious songs and joyful dances have partly been forgotten, and many a member of the tribe speaks the Nepalese idiom with greater ease than his own mother-tongue. Even the name "Lepcha," by which term the aboriginal inhabitants of Sikkim are now generally addressed, is Nepalese.

Very little is known about the origin of the tribe. Racially and linguistically the Lepchas or "Rong," as they call themselves, are distant relatives of their northern neighbours, the Tibetans, but unfortunately nothing has so far been learnt about the way in which they reached their present homesteads. The earliest written historical evidence dates only from the beginning of the 17th century A.D., when a group of Tibetans led by their chieftain Gyebumse crossed the snowy barrier of the Himalayas and settled in the area known today as Sikkim. The immigrants from the north soon discovered that the region which they had selected for their new abode was already inhabited by the "Rong," who were at that time a tribe of jungle-dwelling hunters. The "Rong" claimed possession of this land which they said had been their home since time immemorial, but they readily agreed to share it with the strangers. A few decades later a relative of the chieftain Gyebumse was installed as the first Maharaja of Sikkim and his descendants have been ruling this remote Himalayan State ever since.

The advent of the Tibetans affected the life of the Lepchas in many ways, one of the profoundest con-

sequences having been their contact with Tibetan Buddhism. Coming in the wake of the Tibetan settlers, a group of lamas reached Sikkim and they soon began to convert the Lepchas to the Buddhist faith, an endeavour in which they received all help from Sikkim's new ruling class. To facilitate the work of the lamas, a Lepcha alphabet was modelled after the Tibetan script by Chagdor Namgyé, the third Raja of Sikkim (1700-1717) and with its help a considerable number of Tibetan religious books were translated into the Lepcha language.

The work of the Buddhist missionaries, however, was not completely successful, and remnants of the original Lepcha faith have survived in most of the areas in which members of the tribe live. Though most of the Lepchas nominally profess Buddhism, sorcerers of the old faith are still held in high esteem and in many a household it is customary to invite, in case of need, both the lamas and the Lepcha sorcerers to perform concurrently their appropriate ceremonies.

To study the existing religious concepts of the Lepchas is a most difficult and complex task, as Sikkim's Tibetan Buddhism and the original Lepcha faith have influenced each other considerably in the course of time. The problem is made even more difficult by the fact that the form of Buddhism which spread among the tribes comprised the still little-known doctrines of the "unreformed" Nyingmapas, Dzogchempas and Kargyudpas, religious sects which have preserved in their teachings a great deal of the ancient traditions of Tibet's pre-Buddhist Bon faith. In addition to this, the Lepchas have also come into direct contact with adherents of the Bon, as remnants of the old Bon faith—both in its lower, Shamanistic form as well as in the more highly developed Buddhist-influenced form—are still extant in the Chumbi Valley, in Sikkim's immediate neighbourhood. Intensive research further reveals that the Lepchas have absorbed a number of traditions and religious practices of the Limbus and the Rais, two Mongoloid tribes, members of which are also living within the boundaries of Sikkim.

According to the concepts of the original, unadulterated Lepcha faith the world with all its living and supernatural beings was made by a Divine Creator, addressed variously as Talyang Rum, "the heavenly God," or Takbo Thing, "He who looks after everything." From the ice of Mt. Kanchanjunga—the third highest peak in the world, which dominates the scenery of Sikkim—Talyang Rum is said to have created the ancestors of the Lepchas, the man Fagrong Thing and his wife Nazong Nyo, who began living in the legendary country of Mayel, situated somewhere behind Mt. Kanchanjunga's ice-walls. Simultaneously with this pair, Talyang Rum brought into existence seven divine brothers and their wives, all of whom are believed to be still

residing in Mayel. Through Sakyu Rum, the god of fortune, the seven brothers dispense riches and fertility; and in the case of the world's entire population becoming extinct, the seven pairs of divine beings would create new men.

The first children who were born to Fagrong Thing and Nazong Nyo are said to have been abandoned in the forest by their parents and, having grown up without any proper guidance, to have turned eventually into evil spirits. Later, however, Fagrong Thing and his wife took better care of their offspring and thus eventually the hills and valleys lying at the foot of Mt. Kanchanjunga became the habitation of the descendants of this mythical pair.

Talyang Rum also created the benevolent deities of the Lepcha pantheon, the "Rum" as they are called, and to each of them the Divine Creator assigned a special task, *e.g.*, Li Rum guards the dwellings of the tribe; Agek Alat Rum grants offspring; Komshi Rum helps the hunters to track down game and Nanglyenu Rum acts as the personal guardian of each man. Far more numerous than the "Rum" are the "Moong" or evil spirits, who live in rocks, and trees, on mountain peaks and in the waters of rivers and lakes. They are held responsible for all the misfortunes and accidents which befall men; Sagrong Moong kills lonely travellers and eats their flesh; Mazom Moong, whose voice can sometimes be heard at night, sends illness and death; Shom Moong induces people to commit suicide; Nungo Moong raises evil passions, etc.

One of the strangest figures among the host of malignant spirits is Hlo Moong or Chu Moong, "the Goblin of the Snow-Mountains," who is regarded as the master and protector of all wild animals. His home is said to be the region lying above the line of eternal snow, and many a Lepcha hunter claims to have seen this mysterious being during a hunting trip to the higher tracts of the Himalayas. The description of Chu Moong, who is said to have the appearance of an enormous brown ape, resembles in many ways that of the legendary "abominable snowman" of the Sherpas and the Tibetans.

Out of the great number of Lepcha legends, at least the two most important ones should be mentioned. The story of the great deluge—told by so many peoples of the world, independently of the Bible's evidence—is well known also among the Lepchas, who narrate that, when the all-destroying flood came, a few members of the tribe found safety on Mt. Tentong in the south of Sikkim and that later, as the waters continued to rise, the benevolent deities caused the mountain to grow higher as well; and only after a bird with a twig in its beak had been seen did the survivors dare to descend from their refuge. Also the story of the great tower which was built in order to reach heaven—another parallel to an account in the Bible—is told

among the Lepchas. The legend has it that a Lepcha clan called Naong succeeded in erecting a high tower, but through a misunderstanding its base was cut and the collapsing structure killed most of the workmen. A newer version of this legend says that the tower was built out of pots on a sheltered plateau in Western Sikkim, and through a close investigation of this narrative I happened to discover a vast ancient urnfield at the spot mentioned in the legend.

The propitiation of the "Rum" and the "Moong," the performance of divination ceremonies and the conducting of the various rites at times of marriage, birth and death are the task of the "Bongthings," the sorcerer-priests of the Lepchas. A Bongthing is usually assisted by a "Mun," a sorceress, who acts primarily as a medium through which divinities and spirits of the dead speak to men. The practice of magical rites by the Bongthings and the Muns, mostly accompanied by animal sacrifice, induced many an Occidental or Tibetan writer to make the rather sweeping statement that the ancient Lepcha faith was identical with the Bon, the pre-Buddhist religion of Tibet. A closer examination shows, however, that the Lepcha faith cannot be identified with the Bon, at least not with its now prevalent Buddhist-influenced form. The evidence so far collected makes it more probable that the original religious belief of the Lepchas is a remnant of the earliest, Shamanistic stratum of Central Asia, out of which, in Tibet, parts of the old, unorganized Bon developed, under the pressure of Buddhism into a religious system. It is therefore not correct to say that the Lepcha faith and the Bon are identical; it would be more correct to say that both have sprung from the same root and that consequently they have a number of elements in common.

It would lead us too far to discuss in detail here all the observations which indicate that the old Lepcha faith is to be regarded as a remnant of Central Asian Shamanism, but at least a few interesting examples should be given. Just as the real Siberian Shaman is believed to be forced by an ancestral spirit to accept his office, so also among the Lepchas the belief is current that an ancestral deity compels a member of a family to become a Bongthing or a Mun. The person selected by the divinity suffers from attacks of fever and cramps—which are, however, well differentiated by the Lepchas from ordinary epileptic fits—and then remains in a state of painful semi-consciousness until he or she consents to accept the position of a wizard-priest or a sorceress. Should the person refuse—and to most people such a visitation is very unwelcome—the illness would continue and might eventually lead to death. The symptoms begin to disappear as soon as the person agrees to the ancestral deity's demand, and they vanish completely once an elder Bongthing or Mun begins to

initiate the candidate.

After the initiation rites have been completed the ancestral deity will start acting as a divine adviser and protector of the new sorcerer. Should two Bongthings or Muns fight each other by supernatural means, then their respective ancestral deities will meet in combat and the result of their encounter will decide the fate of their *protégés*—again a similarity to Shamanistic conceptions.

The characteristic rite of despatching a Shaman's soul in order that it may guide the spirit of a deceased person to the other world, or to free it from the power of a demon who has intercepted it, finds a corresponding theme in a rite of the Lepchas which is usually carried out by a Mun after a death has occurred in a family. In the course of this ceremony the Mun, while in a trance, conducts the soul of the deceased on a last journey through the Lepcha land and after the spirit has made known his last wishes through the mouth of the sorceress he is brought with the help of wild birds to the realm of the dead. Similar to the custom of binding some of the Siberian Shamans with a rope when they are entering into a trance, a rope is tied on such an occasion to the left hand of the Mun and its other end is fastened to the severed right foreleg of an ox which has been sacrificed previously. Should this rite be omitted, then—the Lepchas believe—the spirit of the deceased would probably fall into the power of a demon and in that case the soul of the deceased too, might finally become a harmful spirit; a Mun will then have to be called in to free the captured soul and conduct it safely to the place of eternal rest.

Another striking analogy between Shamanism and the old Lepcha faith is the custom, when a Bongthing is buried, of placing a small ladder in his grave so that his soul "may ascend with its help to heaven"; the same conception is found in genuine Shamanism, where a ladder, real or symbolic, is used in various rites for the same purpose.

Besides the Mun and the Bongthing there are two other groups of sorcerers, who, though of foreign origin, occupy a firmly established position in the religious life of the non-Buddhist section of the Lepcha tribe. From the early, unorganized Bon religion of the Chumbi Valley came the "Pawo" and the "Nyenjomo." Among the Lepchas the name "Pawo" is given to men who claim to become possessed by spirits of the ancient Tibetan pantheon. The Pawo dress in Tibetan robes and perform, with bells and drums, ecstatic dances in which the Nyenjomo, their female assistants, participate.

More uncommon are the "Yaba" and the "Yama" wizard-priests and female magicians of the Lepchas, who are said to act as the mediums of spirits worshipped by the Limbus, and hence speak in Limbu during their trances.

In Sikkim and the Darjeeling District, the Lepcha faith is fast disappearing, while very little information is obtainable regarding the usages of the Lepchas who live in Bhutan. All signs, however, indicate that the Lepcha community of Nepal has preserved most of the ancient religious traditions and research among this section of the tribe, which has its home in an area so far inaccessible to ethnographers, would certainly yield new and conclusive evidence.

R. DE NEBESKY-WOJKOWITZ

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

C. de Beauvoir Stocks. "Folk-lore and Customs of the Lap-chas of Sikhim." *Journal* and *Proceedings*, Asiatic Society of Bengal, N. S. Vol. XXI, No. 4. Calcutta, 1925.

J. Morris. *Living with Lepchas*. London, 1938.

G. Gorer. *Himalayan Village*. London, 1938.

R. de Nebesky-Wojkowitz and G. Gorer "The Use of Thread-crosses in Lepcha Lamaist Ceremonies." *The Eastern Anthropologist*, Vol. IV, No. 2. Lucknow, 1951.

R. de Nebesky-Wojkowitz "Ancient Funeral Ceremonies of the Lepchas." *The Eastern Anthropologist*, Vol. V, No. 1. Lucknow, 1952.

LAW AND ORDER

Prof. Fulvio Maroi, whose thoughtful and well-documented study of "Law as the Foundation of Community Life" opens the January 1953 issue of *East and West* (Rome) confines his attention to the West, but for a suggestive reference to the relationship between the Latin *jus* (law) and the Avestic *yaos* and Vedic *joh*. The latter, he writes, connote vaguely "health, safety, well-being."

Plato's use of the term "justice" for harmony between the several parts of the Soul is mentioned, as also the concept of Greek medicine that health meant harmony between the several parts of the body. Similarly the health of the community is shown to depend upon justice, as assuring the harmony of the several parts of the social body. In both ancient Greece and Italy, he shows, the concept of Justice, *i.e.*, of law as the supreme principle that governs the Universe, was taught.

The concept of justice, as also of universal Law, was basic too to ancient Indian thought. The Indian social structure, including the ancient idea of Kingship, rested upon *Dharma*, or the obligation of each to perform properly his particular function in society. The law of periodicity, of rhythm, of action and reaction, is at the basis of the Eastern teachings of alternating periods of manifestation and dissolution for the universe and of the reaping by each man of his own Nemesis, through successive lives on earth. The ancient Indian lawgiver, Manu, declared:—

> Justice being violated, destroys; justice, being preserved, preserves; therefore justice must not be violated, lest violated justice destroy us. (VIII. 15)

Professor Maroi presents the idea of *Civitas* (the city or the State) as "in a broader sense, a tacit inter-family association." He traces the idea of a city under a common law down to the latest plans for a World Government, holding that the State of tomorrow will certainly be One State, provided that in it justice reigns.

NEW BOOKS AND OLD

LITERARY

Shakespeare's Histories at Stratford, 1951. By J. DOVER WILSON and T. C. WORSLEY. Photographs by ANGUS MCBEAN. (Max Reinhardt, London. 96 pp. 1952. 15s.) Received through the courtesy of the British Council.

Hamlet through the Ages: A Pictorial Record from 1709. Compiled by RAYMOND MANDER and JOE MITCHENSON. Edited with an Introduction by HERBERT MARSHALL. (Rockliff, London. 156 pp. 1952. 35s.)

1951 was the year of the Festival of Britain. The roots of tradition were exposed to view, and a justifiable sense of elation filled the air. At the Shakespeare Memorial Theatre at Stratford, a bold attempt was made to present *Richard II*, the two parts of *Henry IV* and *Henry V* as a historical cycle, a "tetralogy,"—one great play that was "not only a living epic of England through the reigns of the three Kings, but also a profound commentary on Kingship." The true hero of the "tetralogy" was Henry V, the ideal King, "brave, warlike, generous, just, and—it must be added—loving humour." Mr. Anthony Quayle, the Director of the Cycle as a whole, had every right to interpret the four plays in the way he did, and it is a plausible enough interpretation of Shakespeare's intention. On the other hand, such stress on continuity and integral unity must necessarily affect the rendering of particular parts—notably Richard II, Hotspur, Falstaff and Hal-Harry himself. Michael Redgrave as Richard and as Hotspur gave deeply affecting performances: yet these parts had to be toned down so that Bolingbroke and Hal-Harry might shine all the better. Likewise, Mr. Quayle as Falstaff was a magnificent figure of fun, witty and infectiously gay; yet he had to subordinate himself to Richard Burton as Hal-Harry. Thus verily like the Bed of Procrustes the "tetralogy" theory interfered with the full amplitude of the parts of Hotspur and Falstaff and, however we may plead excuses and point to the consequential greater significance of the background, it did damage a good deal the beauty and inner causation of the individual plays.

Apart from this consideration, the "Historical Cycle" as presented at Stratford was a triumph of co-operative effort in which directors, actors, Tanya Moiseiwitsch and her permanent Elizabethan sets and costumes, the *genius loci* of Stratford, and the mood of the Festival Year all had their legitimate share. Messrs. Reinhardt have done well to give a permanent form to the Stratford Festival of 1951 by getting the producer, Anthony Quayle, the literary critic, Dover Wilson, and the dramatic critic, T. C. Worsley, to collaborate in the task of re-assessing the productions of the four plays in the general context of the stage history of Shakespeare's plays. Mr. Quayle only contributes a 4-page Foreword, but then his ideas and the manner of their execution are the main theme of the book. Professor Dover Wilson is on the whole sympathetic to Mr. Quayle's interpretation of the Cycle, and helps us to read (or see) the plays as an intelligent Elizabethan might have done. Mr. Worsley covers the productions both as a unity and in their diversity, glances at notices in the press, avoids dogmatism, and almost makes the productions reproduce themselves before our eyes. The numerous photographic illustrations enhance the value of the publication.

If *Stratford 1951* is a souvenir of the Shakespeare Memorial Theatre during the Festival Year, *Hamlet Through The*

Ages is a souvenir commemorating, shall we say, the millionth performance of Shakespeare's greatest and the world's most intriguing play. The editors have spread their net wide and far, and have brought to bear upon their task both discrimination and artistic sense. The play is briefly summarized scene by scene, and illustrated by sketches, caricatures or photographs of actual productions. The play is one: Hamlet is one: yet are the play and the hero presented in a thousand different ways. No production is quite a repetition of another, and not even the tamest Hamlet is devoid of some unique traits. Was Hamlet lean or fat, fair or haggard, boyish or mature? Was Claudius a villain to look at or rather a deceptively reassuring sort of person? We shall never agree about any of these points and producers, actors and critics will wrangle agitatedly to the end of time. Herein lies the infinite charm and supreme lifelikeness of *Hamlet*.

Turning over the pages of this book, we see how variously *Hamlet* has been rendered by the producers, actors and actresses of 25 different countries including India, and, marvelling greatly, we find ourselves reopening the old questions once again. Here are gathered together lean Hamlets (Irving, Alec Guinness, Edwin Booth), fat Hamlets (Alice Marriott, John Henderson, Vassily Katchaloff), a Japanese Hamlet (Fujisawa), a Polish Hamlet (Wrzykowski), youthful Hamlets (Frank Benson, Sarah Bernhardt), elderly Hamlets (Forbes Robertson, Laurence Olivier)—154 Hamlets in all! The Ghost is sometimes a majestic person, and sometimes a mere cloud-like spook. Zvezdochotov as Claudius is very impressive, and there are numerous successful Ophelias—among them the Japanese Sada Yacco, the Russian Vera Komisarjevskaya, and Jean Simmons in the Laurence Olivier picture. The pictorial record covers theatrical history of nearly 250 years, and foreign productions too are judiciously represented. The notes, the index, the end-pieces, as also the commentaries and the 257 illustrations make a feat of editorial ingenuity and a triumph of book production.

K. R. SRINIVASA IYENGAR

Goethe the Alchemist: A Study of Alchemical Symbolism in Goethe's Literary and Scientific Works. By RONALD D. GRAY. (Cambridge University Press. 312 pp. Illustrated. 1952. 35s.)

Johann Wolfgang von Goethe was a man of amazing versatility. The two sides of his character were clear-cut, the one from the other; yet in his writings they are closely mingled. He was a level-headed lawyer, scientist and botanist. But he was also dreamer, dramatist, novelist and Germany's greatest lyric poet; a visionary who believed that the experiences of life, good and bad, were to be taken and used as a moral education of the soul in its journey to the light.

The last quarter of the 18th century, during which Goethe lived, was a period of revival of mystical and semi-mystical beliefs. Men were searching desperately for something that would satisfy their spiritual yearnings. Occultism was popular with many intellectuals and alchemy, although science had already dealt it its death-blow, enjoyed a sudden spasmodic burst of popularity.

It seems strange, perhaps, that so lucid a thinker as Goethe should have been attracted by the work of the alchemists, but it was undoubtedly the mystical side of their work that drew him, its ancient traditions and complete absorption with the unfathomable depths of man's mind.

The purpose of this book by Ronald Gray is to show, by a study of Goethe's literary and scientific works and the alchemical symbolism found in them, how strong the influence of these early experiments upon his life was. Goethe was well aware of the crudity and limitations of the old alchemists

but that did not deter him from enthusiastic study of their teaching.

This is not a book for the casual reader. It presupposes too extensive a knowledge of Goethe's life and writings and without this there can be no real appreciation of the skill with which the author has developed his theme.

The book is divided into three parts: Alchemy, Science, Life and Literature. The first section, dealing with Goethe's alchemical experiments as a young man, is extremely interesting; especially the chapter on the work of the Silesian mystic Jacob Boehme.

In the second section Goethe's advance to scientific work and his discoveries are described. He brought to science the same zeal that he had given to alchemy. His studies in optics resulted in a new theory of colours; he found a rudimentary inter-maxillary bone in the human body, and his concept of a primal plant, *Urpflanze*, as he called it, evolved from the basic leaf form, was a step towards the later work of Charles Darwin.

The final section deals with his life and writings.

This book is one to be recommended, but it cannot be read lightly and for full understanding the reader should have a working knowledge of the German language.

A. M. Low

Heroic Poetry. By C. M. Bowra. (Macmillan and Co., Ltd., London. 590 pp. 1952. 40s.)

Any book by Sir Maurice Bowra is bound to be a work of wide and distinguished scholarship. To the subject of heroic poetry he has brought an epic manner most apt, and copious illustrations of great geographical and historical scope with one staggering exception—India. How it came about that Sir Maurice, whose energy can only be described on acquaintance as a benevolent volcanic eruption, overlooked the *Mahabharata* and the *Ramayana* is difficult to conjecture. I can only guess that his knowledge of China has so absorbed his Asian interests that even his enormous capacity for scholarly appreciation quailed before the Hindu Himalaya of epic poetry.

In this brief review it is impossible to do justice to the vast field of heroic verse that Sir Maurice covers. He gives examples of songs of praise composed by court minstrels for the King of Uganda, and the Kings of the Zulus, which bear a remarkable resemblance to the Psalms of Israel. He instances the narrative devices in Russian epic poetry, both ancient and modern. He fully covers such familiar masterpieces as the *Iliad* and *Odyssey*, but takes care not to miss less well-known poems of Uzbek, Armenian, Norse, Germanic, Chinese and Tibetan origin. Altogether, with the exception of India, his scope is astounding.

Getting a bird's eye view of the world's heroic poetry in this volume, an issue quite outside Sir Maurice's province strikes me. So much of the epic narrative consists in praise of glorious warriors, and the drunken orgies in which it would appear they invariably indulge after victory. Is there not material here for a significant psychological study of the human condition by a modern Freud? Perhaps Sir Maurice has among his Oxford colleagues someone capable of making an analysis of this disturbing evidence, and thereby rendering an inestimable service to the actors in the events which may inspire the epic poetry of the future.

Dennis Gray Stoll

Two Women: A Play in Three Acts. By Bharati Sarabhai. Foreword by C. P. Ramaswami Aiyar. (Hind Kitabs, Ltd., Bombay. 121 pp. 1952. Rs. 7/8)

The stage is set in the house of Kanak Raya, the Prime Minister of an Indian State in Saurashtra. The period is that of India in transition. The Anglicized Kanak Raya attaches an

exaggerated value to the externals of the English way of life and has an almost withering contempt for things Indian. He tries to mould his home and family life to an outlandish pattern which is fast breaking up under the influence of the national movement led by Mahatma Gandhi. Anuradha, his wife, is essentially Indian in character, sentiments and outlook, in spite of her visit to Europe with her husband. She silently rebels against the artificial atmosphere which her husband is seeking to introduce into the home, though she is not sufficiently strong to assert herself. Of incident or plot there is very little, the clash of personalities, or rather of differing attitudes to life, providing the main interest.

The women who dominate the scene are Anuradha and Urvashi Devi, the homeless dancer and devotional singer —girlhood companions, each with a strong initial artistic and devotional urge but differently moulded by circumstances—one into the disillusioned companion of a self-centred and domineering husband, the other into a woman fully conscious of her power to sway the crowd by her religious and political fervour. Believing in her high destiny, Urvashi tells Darshan, who loves her, that, life having chosen her, she cannot marry him.

Sudha, Kanak Raya's niece, is "a convent product with Anglo-India painted all over her." Miss Boulton, the Welsh governess, exuding contempt for the Indian way of life, humours her employer and encourages him in his talk about the superiority of Western education and manners. She is a caricature of the governess who once formed an inseparable part of the households of the Indian aristocracy.

The only event worth speaking of in the play is the arrival of Urvashi Devi, which upsets the Kanak Raya household. Lata, the daughter of the family, is Anuradha's only solace. In her future the mother hopes to see fulfilled her own frustrated aspirations. The characters represent attitudes to life peculiar to an India shaking off the dominance of a foreign culture. The play throbs with ideas rather than with living human characters.

KAMALA S. DONGERKERY

The Slave of Ideas and Other Plays. By A. S. PANCHAPAKESA AYYAR. (V. Ramaswami Sastrulu and Sons, Madras. Third edition, 198 pp. Rs. 2/8)

The three plays in this little book are, no doubt, meant to be read, not played since for staging they would require considerable modification; and we wonder why the author did not put his plots into short-story form. They deal with peculiarly Indian customs and superstitions with the laudable aim of provoking readers to think for themselves upon some of the social problems that these produce in modern India.

The first play deals with false asceticism *vs.* modern moral laxity; the second with corrupt marriage customs and widow re-marriage; the last with revolting, almost incredible superstition and its equally hideous exploitation, and the general ignorance and ineptness in the face of both.

The plays certainly expose some of India's dirtiest linen in the public view—we cannot say "wash"—for nothing is given by the author even to imply a means for purification. It is simply an *exposé*; and we hope with him that it will stimulate thought, and in the right direction.

E. P. T.

On Writing, Reading and Literary Appreciation: A Practical and Cultural Guide. By W. NIGHTINGALE BROWN. (John Sherratt and Son, The Saint Ann's Press, Altrincham, Cheshire. 251 pp. 1952. 16*s.*)

This book has what the author calls a plain "label title," but shows a different quality from the usual *vade mecum* for fledgling writers. In vitality of style, and even in its devotion to

the compound epithet, it is reminiscent of Sir Thomas Browne's *Religio Medici*. It displays a nice blending of the analytical and the empathic, of the techno-grammatical and the stimulative "magical." The *spirit* of words is considered as the golden key "which leads to a domain of language where words have a halo as well as a meaning," and through the choice and juxtaposition of words is the transformation of the things of earth "into living emblems, spiritualizations of concrete things." The author makes a good distinction between psychic and spiritual inspiration, holding that "the mystical is the divine magnet which underlies all great art." The book is not confined, however, to the communication of winged feelings, but concerns itself also with the conveyance of facts about syntax and salesmanship, proof-readers' marks, despatch and records of MSS., etc. It should be inspiriting and helpful.

E. W.

INDIANA

The Purana Index. Vol. II, from T to M. By V. R. RAMACHANDRA DIKSHITAR. Madras University Historical Series No. 19. (Madras University, Madras. 746 pp. 1952. Rs. 20/-)

The first volume of *The Purana Index* has already been reviewed in THE ARYAN PATH (July 1952) and the Madras University deserves congratulations for bringing out the second volume so expeditiously. In this volume the plan adopted in the first is followed: it is indifferent to strict uniformity of translation, there are not sufficient cross-references, and in some places the entries are not complete despite duplications in others. Lack of space precludes our giving references and going into further details on these points.

In reviewing the first volume we stated that it could have been made more useful. Our suggestions could not then have helped with this volume since the press copy must have been ready; but in order that further volumes of the *Index* and other works in the field may have the benefit of our suggestions we are making them here:

The words indexed should be followed by a symbol indicating whether they represent a country: (c), capital: (cap.), king: (k), mountain: (m), etc., and indicating whether the reference is purely mythological: (myth.). It should also be indicated whether kings belong to the Solar (S), or Lunar (L), dynasty. With regard to place names: their location, identifications and theories concerning them, should be briefly stated with references. The cross-references should be complete. Such references as Pañcaśara, Pañcabāna, Paksa, etc., giving merely dictionary meanings, should be omitted.

The printing and get-up are good and we commend this book to all libraries.

A. D. PUSALKER.

Sir William Jones, Orientalist. By GARLAND H. CANNON, JR. (University of Hawaii Press, Honolulu. xvi+88 pp. 1952. $1.50)

Taking advantage of the renewed interest in Sir William Jones's writings, due to the recent appearance of numerous essays and monographs about him in celebration (in 1934) of the 150th Jubilee of the Bengal Asiatic Society which he founded as well as the bicentennial of his birth (1946), G. H. Cannon Jr. has brought out this book. It is "primarily an annotated bibliography of Jones's writings in chronological and topical sequence."

Following a biographical sketch, the first three chapters deal respectively with: Poet and Literary Scholar; Lawyer, Pre-India Period; India Period. There is an Appendix containing

an "edition printing index" and a Bibliography.

Born on September 28th, 1746, Sir William Jones accomplished remarkable things during his brief life of 48 years. He was the father of Indology and one of the earliest interpreters of Eastern culture to European scholars. He was the Founder-President of the Royal Asiatic Society, which inspired the founding of other similar societies. He was a pioneer in almost every branch of Indian studies and the first Englishman to know Sanskrit well, and was said to be the first European to discover the Hindu dramas, founder of comparative philology, and pioneer in Indian epigraphy, making the language and literature of the ancient Hindus accessible to Europeans. His "Seasons" published in 1792, was the first book ever printed in Sanskrit. He gave a basis for Indian Chronology by advancing the Sandrocottos-Candragupta equation.

This book will be useful especially to reference libraries and librarians and to scholars interested in 18th century English literature and comparative Anglo-Oriental studies.

A. D. PUSALKER

Popular Essays in Indian Philosophy. (114 pp.); *The Quest After Perfection.* (112 pp.) By M. HIRIYANNA. (Kavyalaya Publishers, Mysore. 1952. Rs. 5/- or 7*s.* 6*d.* each)

As the author of *Outlines of Indian Philosophy* and of *The Essentials of Indian Philosophy*, the late Professor Hiriyanna's name has become well known wherever Indian philosophy is studied. During his long professorial career he wrote numerous essays, practically all on Indian philosophy, for various journals and conferences. The publishers deserve the thanks of all lovers of Indian Philosophy for having rescued these scattered essays from their comparative obscurity and published them in book form.

The two volumes under review, published almost simultaneously, are perhaps to be followed by others. As many as five of the essays in the first volume appeared in THE ARYAN PATH. Professor Hiriyanna had remarkable gifts of lucid exposition and of compressing deep thought in terse, apt language. Hence whatever he wrote was excellent and worth preserving.

Professor Hiriyanna was an orthodox Advaitin, for whom Shankara was the last word in philosophy. But he displayed the merit of expounding Shankara's thought in modern garb, utilizing European philosophy and English poetry alike to drive home to his readers the wisdom of Advaita.

The two essays on "The Quest after Perfection" were first delivered as the Principal Miller Lectures at the University of Madras in 1940. They constitute a remarkable example of how ancient thought can be presented in modern garb. If Professor Hiriyanna was first and foremost a Sanskritist, he had an innate philosophic zest which flowered when he had an opportunity of teaching Indian philosophy to the highest classes in the University of Mysore. Since the title of these lectures constitutes the title of the second volume, they should have been printed first instead of being given the fifth place though that is justifiable chronologically. This is almost the only adverse criticism one can offer in connection with the volumes, which are excellent in their contents as in external appearance, for which the Wesley Press of Mysore may be congratulated. All students of Indian philosophy will find in these volumes an excellent presentation of various problems from the Advaitic standpoint. Those who do not accept this will find a good deal to differ from, but even they will be struck by the clear logical exposition of which Professor Hiriyanna was a master.

A. R. WADIA

Bharatiya Desabhakta Caritam. Part I (x + 86 pp. Re. 1/8); *Sri Sabari Vilasam.* xi + 108 pp. Re. 1/4) Both

by K. S. NAGARAJAN, B.SC. (Author, No. 11, Wilson Gardens, Bangalore 2. 1952.)

The *Bharatiya Desabhakta Caritam* contains, in simple and flowing Sanskrit prose, five biographical sketches, based on English and Kannada sources, of the late Maharaja Krishnaraja of Mysore, Dr. S. Radhakrishnan, the late Dinabandhu C. F. Andrews, B. G. Tilak and Swami Vivekananda, with a photograph of each. The book ends with a short poem in praise of Bharata. Pandit Nagarajan's employment of Sanskrit for modern biographies is a commendable new departure. The subsequent parts will be eagerly awaited, but the names of persons and places should be more accurate and the proof-reading more careful.

Sri Sabari Vilasam is a poem in six cantos, dealing with an episode in the *Skanda Purana*. Lord Siva in a game of dice lost everything to Parvati, including his apparel, and chagrined, retreated to a mountain cavern. Parvati's initial elation and her confidence in her ability to rule the Universe without her Lord did not last long. Smitten by the pangs of separation from him, she assumed the form of a Sabara woman, danced before him and winning him over, she brought him back to Mount Kailasa. Two short concluding hymns praise respectively the Goddess Visalaksi, and the holy Ganga and Yamuna Rivers.

These books, the one in prose, the other in verse, show that Shri Nagarajan excels in writing verses in a variety of metres and in skilfully adapting striking verses from great poets like Kalidasa to suit his theme.

N. A. GORE

To Ashram Sisters: From 6-12-1926 to 30-12-1929. Gandhiji's Letters, Vol. 1. Translated By ARVINDLAL L. MAZMUDAR; edited by KAKA KALELKAR. (Navajivan Publishing House, Ahmedabad. xix + 116 pp. 1952. Re. 1/8)

"As I see women and their condition during my travels, I think of the enormous work before you, and feel sure that real education is of the heart." Gandhiji wrote this in 1929. Twenty-four years have passed. What is the condition of women today? In the interval India has achieved political freedom and framed a Constitution which gives Indian women the vote, equality before the law and the assurance that there will be no discrimination against them on grounds of sex. On paper their condition has vastly improved. Let us take a very honest look at our villages. To what extent have women been able to avail themselves of the rights and opportunities thus secured?

The work to be done in this connection is still enormous and in nature it is educative. Women must be educated to the right use of their opportunities. Just how the work of education should proceed in order to produce the best results is further explained by Gandhiji in this letter. He goes on to say:—

> If there is pure love in the heart, everything else follows automatically. The field of service is unlimited. Our capacity for service also can become unlimited, as there is no limit to the capacity of the spirit. If the gates of the heart are open, everything can get into it. Even a little service by such people bears immense fruit. But service by one whose heart is sealed to others will amount to nothing.

Is this less true in 1953 than it was in 1929? The amount of work to be done has not diminished except to a very small extent. Our task is to put our Constitution into the hearts of the women. The means of doing it have not altered. Let us then seek and find within ourselves the need for an unlimited capacity to serve. The urge to serve should grow as opportunities for service open up before us.

Gandhiji's letters contain many such memorable passages. A large part of his message has to be sought for in letters. His letters to women are being collected and published in a separate series of which this is the first

volume. The translation from the original Gujarati is adequate.

LILA RAY

Punjab Prelude: By L. F. LOVEDAY PRIOR. (John Murray, London. 218 pp. 1952. 18*s.*)

The author came out to the Punjab in 1945 to join the staff of the Aitchison College in Lahore. She says in her Foreword:

> Both the man travelling on business, or dealing with firms in Pakistan and Bharat, and the politician and diplomat, need to know what foreign peoples are like, or costly mistakes may be made.

Hence her present contribution towards this praiseworthy objective. But it is painful to record that her book, instead of building a bridge between Britain and India, sets up a barrier. Witness statements like the following:—

> It is useless to expect an Indian husband to be physically faithful... (p. 46)...the Hindu has no sense of social or public obligation (p. 126)...it is a tradition in Persia and India, that poets must get drunk in order to be inspired (p. 137) The object of the Party [Congress] is not (as is given out) the making of a modern and decent India...the record of Hindustan since it became independent...is a story of power-politics and chicanery, quite naked....That highly ambiguous saint (and very cunning politician) Mr. Gandhi..." (p. 174) Behind this cry [the cry of Pakhtoonistan] and this political activity is the hand of Hindustan, which is alleged to be paying the Afghans to pursue this policy. (p. 193). Hindustan is dominated by a religion which is repulsive and reprehensible in practice. (p. 206)

Punjab Prelude is certainly not a prelude either to the prosperity of the Punjab or to the betterment of relations between Pakistan and Hindustan, or between these and Britain.

G. M.

Indian Child Art: A Handbook for Teachers. By GAY HELLIER. (Geoffrey Cumberlege; Oxford University Press, Madras. 160 pp. 1951. Rs. 5; 8*s.* 6*d.*)

This is a book which should be read not only by teachers of art in primary and secondary schools but also by all lovers of art and by parents who would like to see their children find self-expression and satisfaction through drawing and painting. It deals not with the creative efforts of unusually talented children but tells us how, through the correct teaching of art, we can help a normal child to become more adjusted to his environment and be a more fulfilled human being.

There have been radical changes in the method of teaching art in schools throughout the world. Miss Gay Hellier points out the difference between the old and the new methods of teaching. Formerly the main emphasis was on copying pictures and reproducing drawings done by the teacher on the blackboard. The children felt cramped and inhibited. They feared and almost dreaded their drawing classes. This old method of teaching was particularly artificial and lacking in spontaneous expression in a country like India, where most of the pictures copied by the students were Western in conception and had no link with their own environment and background. They were, moreover, painted in a style which was completely foreign to the native artistic tradition of the people.

In recent years there has grown up a new outlook on art and the new methods now employed stress spontaneous self-expression and aim at giving self-satisfaction and self-confidence to the child. These changes have not been as far-reaching in Indian schools as in the West owing to certain difficulties such as lack of equipment and of space, but wherever the new method is being tried it has given promising results. The charming illustrations of children's paintings are themselves a proof of that.

Miss Hellier draws on her practical experience in teaching art in Indian schools and it is in this respect that her book is of special value to us. She is only too well aware of the handicaps and difficulties that art teachers in our country have to contend with, but, taking all this into consideration, she

has shown how it is still possible to give art its right place in the school curriculum.

The book is divided into four parts. In Part I we are told about the aims and outlook of the new method of teaching. Part II deals with that new method in primary and secondary schools. Part III tells us about art crafts closely linked with drawing and painting, and Part IV has to do with the training of teachers and with how to develop artistic appreciation and an æsthetic sense.

In the last year or so there have been a number of Child Art Exhibitions in this country and a great deal of interest in the subject has been awakened. Miss Hellier's conclusions will therefore be encouraging to us. She believes that there is great talent for art latent in Indian children, which, if developed in the right way, would enrich our culture and that it will be partly through their work that India will realize her artistic destiny.

SHAKUNTALA MASANI

No Doubt India. By J. HERMAN BOSTAN. (Zuid-Hollandsche Uitgevers Maatschappij, The Hague, Holland: Distributed by Simpkin Marshall, Ltd, London. 129 pp. Illustrated. 1953. 12*s.* 6*d.*)

Many families possess snap-shot albums, interesting to them because of memories evoked, but, for the most part, too personal and amateurish for other people to have more than a casual interest in them.

This book has something of the characteristics of such a personal snap-shot album, both in the anecdotal style of writing, the 52 photographs that illustrate it, and the inconsequential way it jumps from topic to topic, from place to place, with no chronological order. There are some interesting titbits of information—the writer seems to have travelled fairly widely in India and the East (at a guess, in connection with rubber); there are tributes to the virtues of the Indian character, wryly humorous comments on Indian hygiene (or lack of it), comparisons between Eastern and Western outlook and manners, and so on. None of it goes very deep, but it all adds up to a picture of a friendly, pleasant personality, anxious to forward a better understanding between East and West. It was courageous of the author and publishers to tackle a book in—for them—a foreign language, but it would have been easier for the reader had it been sub-edited and proof-read by an English person.

W. E. W.

The First Book of Negroes. By LANGSTON HUGHES. (Franklin Watts, Inc., New York. 70 pp. 1952. $1.75)

Langston Hughes writes that if your child but knew something about Negroes—like where they came from, how they got here, and why their skins are dark—the child would not want to discriminate against them, for he would find doing so very silly. Hughes drives this theme home by several stories: the drama of Harriet Tubman's unselfish devotion to others through the "underground railway"; George Washington Carver's devotion to others through his knowledge of chemistry; the Negro's devotion to his country through the realization that "Miss Liberty," after all, does not wear a "crown."

Little Terry, in the book, thought, somehow, that she wore a star. Could it possibly be a star of hope—of hope for a brighter day for your child, too?

NELSON HENRY NICHOLS

Roads to Agreement: Successful Methods in the Science of Human Relations. By STUART CHASE in collaboration with MARIAN TYLER CHASE. (Phœnix House, Ltd., London. 250 pp. 1952. 18*s*.)

Roads to Agreement are, in most parts of the world today, swept by the big profits of armaments' manufacturers and the blast of ideological gunfire. Any book, therefore, which tries to see through the propagandist smoke and the high dividends of patriotism, is welcome.

Mr. Chase is an American reporter and interpreter rather than an original thinker. The fact that he is saying about contemporary events what an intelligent undergraduate could perceive twenty years ago is nothing against his book. The readers in the United States, for whom it was originally intended, are no more mentally advanced than the general public anywhere. Ready to panic like sheep whenever ambitious politicians raise the alarm, they are easily driven, obediently bleating the ignorant slogans of the herd. Any book which may help to open their eyes and minds, which may persuade them to pause and think instead of blindly hurtling over the precipice into World War III, will be gratefully received by all.

The solutions to world problems offered by Mr. Chase are mostly hints along sane lines. It is almost as if, in writing about peace, he treads gingerly like a junior doctor through a lunatic asylum where the inmates are gleefully bent on secret stock-piling of atomic bombs. He obviously feels that any suggestion from him that the insane are not sincerely working for world peace will cause them to turn and rend their doctor.

With great caution, and with many careful steps to soften his intimations of wisdom, he gently enlightens the sheep. We wish him well, and hope that he will have a large attentive audience. He is out to free the individual sheep-mind so that the vast national herds may at last become maturely thoughtful men and women. This delicate process he calls "semantics," giving the word a wider meaning than is usual. He writes:—

> Once a person grasps the semantic idea, he is like a man released from prison—a prison of words. Most of us are still locked in. We march endlessly up and down our ideological cells, or round and round a prison yard paved with flint-like absolutes. Semantics helps to open the door and liberate us.

An excellent description. It is unfortunate that all societies and the powers-that-be everywhere praise and reward the man locked in an ideological cell, provided it is their own, and regard the man with a genuinely free mind as an outcast. Mr. Chase offers no solution to this problem.

DENNIS GRAY STOLL

A Documentary History of the United States. By RICHARD D. HEFFNER. (A Mentor Book. The New American Library of World Literature, New York. 287 pp. 1952. 35 cents)

In this small volume Professor Heffner has essayed to give not only a survey of the history of the United States from its foundation up to the present but also the texts of 35 major documents which have shaped that history. The period covered being so long and the material available so profuse, the task of selection and elucidation was no easy one. But the author has performed it with skill and discrimination. His introductory sketches to each of the 25 chapters show not only his capacity to marshal facts but also his ability to focus attention on the important issues with which the nation has had to grapple at various stages. The selection of the documents for inclusion has also been made with critical judgment.

In the Farewell Address delivered by Washington in 1796 (included in the volume), the retiring President, the Father of the American Nation, cautioned his compatriots against "per-

manent alliances, with any portion of the foreign world." Conditions have changed so radically, however, since Washington's day that the creed of isolationism is now dead in America. The nation has today taken the lead in trying to strengthen the democratic forces in the world. It is significant, therefore, that the last document in the collection is an address delivered by Secretary of State George Marshall at Harvard University in 1947 to explain the main features of his plan to make large funds available for the economic reconstruction of the European countries.

Professor Heffner, in two chapters headed "Boom and Bust" and "The Roosevelt Revolution," has given us a most informative sketch, backed up by illustrative documents, of the complex social and economic forces which operate in a highly industrialized country like the United States. He has forcibly argued the imperative necessity of controlling those forces in the larger interests of the country.

Three documents included in this volume require special mention. The first is Jefferson's First Inaugural Address, delivered in 1801. I do not know of any other document which puts the essential ideas comprehended in the term "Democracy" with greater lucidity or power. The second is the great speech which Daniel Webster delivered in the Senate in 1830 in reply to Hayne, defending "Liberty *and* Union, now and forever, one and inseparable" as the sheet-anchor of American prosperity and greatness. But unity had to be forged in the crucible of a civil war. The third document is the immortal Gettysburg Address of Abraham Lincoln in 1863.

Professor Heffner and his publishers deserve our thanks for giving us a most readable volume for the modest price of 35 cents.

M. RAMASWAMY

Madeleine: A Story of the Resistance. By JEAN OVERTON FULLER. (Victor Gollancz, Ltd., London. 192 pp. 1952. 13*s.* 6*d.*)

Though in simple guise, this is a most unusual book. It reconstructs the story of a young British secret agent in the French Resistance; it describes not merely the exciting period when "Madeleine" was functioning as the sole radio link between Paris and London, but also the events which followed her arrest and culminated, 10 months later, in her being shot in Germany. Jean Overton Fuller traced with great difficulty all those concerned in this story. From them, English, French and German, she received eager co-operation—a tribute to the fact that her aim in writing was to present a completely impartial account. It was also a tribute to "Madeleine," for, as the story shows, she stands out in all their minds as a brave and noble woman.

Her nobility of character had deep roots. These are revealed in the first part of the book where we learn at once that "Madeleine" was Noor, the daughter of Inayat Khan, an Indian mystic, and an American mother. The breadth of her father's Sufi teaching and her own spiritual awareness gave her a sense of perception which placed all her actions on a plane above the ordinary. It enabled her to take part in warfare without hatred; it enabled her to judge her own life from the standpoint of self-training and spiritual evolution. Said her brother Vilayat, before she joined the Resistance:

> I have a presentiment that my sister will have to meet in this life the most utter blackness of the world. There is a valley down which she will have to walk alone. I know if I were to try to prevent her it would be wrong, because it would be interfering with something that is necessary to her evolution. And yet I shudder.

In judging a character it is the virtues that are distinctive—the failings are the common weaknesses of all mankind. Noor walked alone down her dark valley; her spiritual strength, her courage, her nobility, served her own evolution and the world she loved.

IRENE R. RAY

THE INDIAN INSTITUTE OF CULTURE

[The cultural heritage of India is a closely woven fabric of many strands. One of these colourful strands is the contribution of the followers of Jainism. We publish here, in somewhat condensed form, the lecture given on this subject at the Indian Institute of Culture, Basavangudi, Bangalore, on January 5th, under the chairmanship of Shri K. Guru Dutt. The Jains of old found sanctuary from persecution in Mysore. The lecturer, **Dr. Nathmal Tatia,** is a professor in the new Institute of Buddhist Philosophy, appropriately located at Nalanda, the seat of one of the greatest universities of ancient India —ED.]

JAINA CULTURE

If we visualize the essential features of India's ancient civilization before and during the period of the advent of Tīrthaṅkara Mahāvīra and the Buddha, it will be found that a persistent search for higher values was in the atmosphere. Dissatisfaction with the social conditions and the religious ideals that prevailed was deepening. Philosophical doubts stirred the minds of the people who gathered round enterprising thinkers, or heretic teachers, as they were usually called. Tīrthaṅkara Pārśva, who preceded Mahāvīra by about two centuries and a half, had already given an impetus to the movement which ascribed supreme importance to the sacredness and inviolability of life—a movement which had been recognized by Tīrthaṅkara Nemi who was, if we are to believe the Jaina tradition, a contemporary of Lord Kṛṣṇa, the chief personality of the *Mahabharata* age. It was left to Mahāvīra and his disciples and followers to revitalize and propagate this movement on a more intensive and wider scale, and to give a new orientation to the social outlook and the philosophical quest of the age.

In the course of this movement, a huge literature, mainly religious and philosophical—composed in the prevalent literary languages as well as in classical Sanskrit—grew up in conformity with the spirit of Nirgranthism, for this was the earlier designation of the movement known as Jainism. Scientific subjects like astronomy and mathematics also received elaborate treatment in those compositions, as these were regarded as indispensable for a sound understanding of the ultimate purpose of life. Gradually the need of symbolizing the spiritual values was felt and found expression in Jaina sculpture and painting, which have an æsthetic peculiarity of their own. Thus the Jainas made their contributions to almost all spheres of Indian life. A comparative estimate of these contributions will be helpful for appreciating the value of Jaina culture.

Religion in Jainism is not blind faith. Nor is it emotional worship inspired by fear or wonder. It is the intuition of the inherent purity of consciousness, will and bliss of the self. The approximate Jaina equivalents of "religion," all have as their common connotation: "intuitive love of truth." This love of truth, though inherent in each self, requires spiritual exertion for its manifestation. Once manifested, it will lead the self to liberation sooner or later. The dawn of this intuition is accompanied by a radical change of outlook, enabling one to realize the utter unimportance of the world. This intuition is mystical in the sense that it comes as a momentary flash and demolishes, as if by magic, perverted assessment of worldly values and attachment to them.

Another feature of this religious experience is the intuition of the inviolability of the individual self. What the Upanishads have achieved by recognizing the identity of the individual with the universal and Buddhism has accomplished by non-

recognition of the individuality itself, Jainism has sought to achieve by stressing this inviolability. This is the fundamental basis of disagreement between these three systems of thought.

The moral principles of Jainism are evolved in the light of the religious experience. The inviolable autonomy of the individual rules out subordination to another individual and, moreover, implies the principle of Non-violence as the natural determinant of social relationship. Thus society, according to Jainism, is a co-ordinated aggregate of autonomous units and depends for its own well-being upon that of every individual. No individual being subordinate to any other, and each being entitled to independent self-expression, Jainism rejects the patronizing of one individual or class by another. The gradation of society into classes, therefore, is not in keeping with the spirit of Jainism. It is even regarded theoretically as impossible for one individual to torture another, though this undeniably sometimes happens. It is, on the contrary, recognized that encroachment upon the autonomy of another individual means ultimately an encroachment upon one's own. The scripture thus declares: "Thou art he whom thou intendest to kill! Thou art he whom thou intendest to tyrannize over."[1] An individual accordingly is required for his own sake to refrain from violence.

This moral principle of non-violence presupposes several others for its realization. Of these, truthfulness, non-stealing, celibacy and non-possession of property are the main ones. The necessity of these principles for the enthroning of the self in all its glory is too apparent to need elaboration.

Freedom of the self can be achieved only by recognizing the freedom of others. Falsehood and stealing both imply concealment and self-deception and so stand in the way of self-expression. These must therefore be abandoned and replaced by their opposites, which requires spiritual exertion. Thus one must be prepared to undergo extreme hardship in order to remain true to one's convictions and to earn one's livelihood by honest means. Truthfulness means faithfulness to one's own conscience and non-stealing means non-acceptance of what is not earned or obtained by honest means. In its positive aspect, non-stealing implies creative labour for one's livelihood.

Celibacy has been assigned a place of supreme importance in almost all the systems of Indian thought. It is not merely a formal negation of sensuality, but a strenuous effort to gain self-sufficiency and self-satisfaction.

The principle of non-possession means non-attachment to worldly things. Belief in the higher life, freedom from worldly ambition, and the mutual co-ordination of needs are needed for the cultivation of this principle. Rightly understood and practised, it promotes the growth of an equitable social order which in its turn provides scope for the moral virtues.

Not only Jaina ethics but also Jaina philosophy is based on recognition of the individual as an autonomous rational being. Jaina philosophy therefore rejects all absolute claims, conceding to them only a partial validity. The maker of such claims rejects other approaches as aberrations, failing to recognize the autonomous rationality of his fellow thinkers. The Jaina philosopher finds in such intolerance the seed of the mutually hostile systems of philosophy. He attempts to synthesize these conflicting systems into one philosophy which recognizes their findings as so many aspects of the self-same reality. This is *Anekāntavāda* or non-absolutism.

The Jainas have, moreover, attempted to classify the different philosophical views into a number of types which are known as *Nayas*. Thus the Nyāya-

[1] *Acaranga*, I.5.5.

Vaiśeṣika system, which regards the diverse traits of a thing as numerically and qualitatively different from one another and also from the substratum on which they rest, belongs to the type known as *Naigama Naya* or the pantoscopic approach to reality. Similarly the Vedantist, who accepts existence as applying only to the One Reality and dismisses the diverse characters as unreal appearances, affiliates himself to the type called *Saṅgraha Naya* or the way of synthetic approach. In the same way that system which approaches reality from the analytic point of view may be called *Vyavahāra Naya*. Jainism classifies similarly the other types of thought, whose advocates all expose themselves to the charge of extremism and fanaticism, in so far as they assert their several findings to be exclusive or mutually incompatible. The Jaina philosopher regards them all as only partially true and attempts to synthesize all these glimpses into one comprehensive vision of the whole reality.

A common thread thus runs through the Jaina religion, moral code and philosophy. And this continuous development of the religious experience contributed much to the spiritual, moral and intellectual culture of our country.

The Jainas played a very important part first in the development of the ancient Prākrit languages, as also of the Drāvidian languages of the South: Tamil and Kannada. Somewhat later they adopted Sanskrit to elucidate the contents of the original Prākrit canon and gradually produced a vast Sanskrit literature comprising valuable works on almost all subjects of the day: philosophy, logic, grammar, lexicography, poetics, politics, folk stories, mathematics, astronomy and astrology. Indian literature in all its branches is thus indebted to the achievements of Jaina authors.

As regards the Prākrit canon, it can be compared to the Pāli *Piṭaka* of the Buddhists in respect of subject-matter, method of exposition of cardinal tenets, compilation of religious and philosophical doctrines and the evidence which it affords as to the social, political and economic conditions of ancient India.

The Sanskrit literature of the Jainas contains a number of the leading philosophical and literary classics of India's ancient heritage. Umāsvāti, Siddhasena, Divākara, Samantabhadra, Akalaṅka, Vidyānanda, Haribhadra and Hemacandra, made contributions which are enduring landmarks in the development of Indian thought and culture.

As regards the Jaina influence in the South, the laborious researches of Burness, Bühler, Burgess, Hoernle, Jacobi and Lewis Rice have almost conclusively proved that the Jainas profoundly influenced the political, religious and literary institutions of that part of India. The *Kural*, an ethical poem of considerable importance in ancient Tamil literature, was composed about the 1st century A.D., by Saint Tiruvalluvar, who was definitely a sympathizer with Jainism.[1] It is also now almost certain that the *Tolkāppiyam*, an authoritative work on Tamil grammar which is perhaps the earliest among the Tamil texts extant, was composed by a Jaina author.[2] Among the other important Tamil works of Jaina authorship may be mentioned the *Nāladiyār* and the like, composed during the early centuries of the Christian Era.

The austere life of the Jaina saints greatly appealed to the Drāvidians, as did their love for the languages of the South. In the words of Frazer: "It was through the fostering care of the Jainas that the South seems to have been inspired with new ideals and literature, enriched with new forms and expressions."[3] The period immediately following the age of the *Kural* was characterized by the growth of literature, mainly under Jaina auspices. The

[1] *Vide, Jaina Literature in Tamil.* By A. CHAKRAVARTI. Pp. 14-19.

[2] *Ibid.*, pp. 10-13.

[3] *Literary History of India*, pp. 310-11.

"Augustan Age" of Tamil literature was the period of predominance of the Jainas in intellect and learning, though not in political power.[1] Jainism became the religion of some of the Pandyan Kings.[2] In the 7th century A.D., on account of their persecution in the territory under the Pallava and Pandya Kings, the Jainas migrated to Śravaṇa Belgola in Mysore. There they sought refuge under the Ganga Rulers who extended to them their patronage.

The few who remained in the Tamil land led an obscure life devoid of all political influence in the country. Nevertheless they retained in full their intellectual vitality which had in earlier times produced such classical works as the *Kural*. Thus, during this period of Jaina obscurity, *Vaḷaiyāpati*, *Silappadikāram* and *Jīvaka Cintāmaṇi*, three of the five Tamil Mahākāvyas, were composed by Jaina authors. Among the minor *Kāvyas* composed by Jainas *Yaśodhara Kāvya*, *Cūḍāmaṇi* and *Nīlakeśi* are important. Moreover, the Jainas continued to enrich the vocabulary of Tamil by introducing large numbers of Sanskrit derivatives and bringing them into conformity with Tamil phonetics.

The Jainas rendered valuable and extensive services to Kannada literature also. In the words of the Rev. F. Kittel, they wrote "not only from sectarian motives but also from a love for science, and reproduced several scientific works in Kanarese."[3]

In the 10th century A.D., the Golden Age of Kannada literature, the greatest Jaina poets were writing. Thus Ponna, a Jaina saint upon whom the Rāṣṭrakūta King Kannara conferred the title *Kavicakravarti*, composed *Śāntipurāṇa* and *Bhuvanaika Rāmābhyudaya* during the period. Next we come to the great poet, Pampa, regarded as the father of Kannada literature. Pampa was followed by Ranna, Court poet of the Karṇāṭaka Emperor Thailapa and his son Satyāśraya who succeeded him. He composed many works, of which only two have survived, *Gadāyuddha* and *Ajita Tīrthaṅkara Purāṇa*.

Another great Jaina writer of Kannada prose and poetry in that century was Chāmuṇḍarāya, who, besides being an able administrator and warrior, was a patron of Ranna, among others. It was he who had the colossal image of Gomateśvara carved at Sravaṇa Belgola.

Among the later Jaina authors we may mention Nayacandra, the author of *Mallinātha Pūraṇa* and *Rama candra carita Pūraṇa*; Brahmasiva, the author of *Samayaparīkṣā* and Nayasena, the author of *Dharmāmṛta*.[4]

The Jaina influence on Telugu deserves careful investigation. Practically no research has been done on the subject and we look to competent scholars for enlightenment in this unexplored region.

Very little research, moreover, has been done on the Jaina contributions to science. But from even the little that has been done it is apparent that they achieved memorable success in this field also. Referring to the Jaina classification of animals, Dr. Brajendranath Seal remarks:—

> Umasvati's classification of animals...is a good instance of classification by series, the number of senses possessed by the animal taken to determine its place in the series.[5]

And as regards the Jaina contribution to the atomic theory, the same authority writes:

> "The most remarkable contribution of the Jainas to the atomic theory relates to their analysis of atomic linking, or the mutual attraction (or repulsion) of atoms, in the formation of molecules."[6]

---

[1] *Early History of India*. By V. A. Smith. 1914.
[2] *Studies in South Indian Jainism*. 1922. Pt. I, p. 58.
[3] *Indian Antiquary*. 1875. Vol. IV, p. 15.
[4] I am deeply indebted to Prof. K. S. Dharanendraiya of Bangalore for my acquaintance with the Jaina contribution to Kannada literature.
[5] *The Positive Sciences of the Ancient Hindus*. 1915. P. 188.
[6] *Ibid.*, p. 95.

For an assessment of the Jaina contribution to mathematics we may refer to the valuable paper of Dr. Bibhutibhusan Datta, published in the *Bulletin of the Calcutta Mathematical Society*.[1] A correct appreciation of the Jaina achievements in science requires patient research by scholars trained in different sciences.

The Jainas were also great patrons of art. Indian art, both Northern and Southern, owes to them a number of remarkable monuments. And in architecture their achievements are greater still.[2] Elliot in his *Hinduism and Buddhism* gives a comprehensive idea of the Jaina art and architecture of Northern India when, referring to the Satrunjaya Hill, he says:—

> On every side sculptured chapels gorgeous in gold and colour stand silent and open; within are saints sitting grave and passionless behind the lights that burn on their altars. The multitude of calm stone faces, the strange silence and emptiness, unaccompanied by any sign of neglect or decay, the bewildering repetition of shrines and deities in this aerial castle, suggest nothing built with human purpose but some petrified spirit world.[3]

As single edifices illustrating the beauty of Jaina art, both in design and patient elaboration of workmanship, the temples of Mount Abu may be mentioned.[4]

In South India, too, idol worship and temple building on a grand scale have to be attributed to Jaina influence.[5] There the vast Jaina remains of mutilated statues, deserted caves and ruined temples at once recall to our mind the greatness of the religion in the days gone by.[6] Moreover the colossal monolithic Jaina statues of the South, such as that of Gomateśvara at Sravaṇa Belgola, are among the wonders of the world.

The Jaina contribution to painting also is not negligible. There are remains of beautiful paintings in some of the Jaina caves at Udayagiri and Khaṇḍagiri. It is, however, in illuminated manuscripts that this Jaina art finds its fullest expression. Referring to such paintings of the 15th century A.D., the late great art critic, A. K. Coomaraswamy, remarked:—

> The Jaina art of painting is one of pure draughtsmanship; the pictures are brilliant statements of the facts of the epic, where every event is seen in the light of eternity.... There is no preoccupation with pattern, colour, or texture for their own sake, but these are achieved with inevitable assurance in a way that could not have been the case had they been directly sought. The drawing has in fact the perfect equilibrium of a mathematical equation, or a page of composer's score. Theme and formula compose an inseparable unity, text and pictures form a continuous relation of the same dogma in the same key.[7]

The light and casual handling manifest in these paintings, does not imply a poverty of craftsmanship, but perfect adequacy and is "the direct expression of a flashing religious conviction and of freedom from any material interest."[8] It was, however, at the hands of Śālivāhana—the great artist who flourished in the reign of that great connoisseur, the Mogul Emperor Jehangir—that the Jaina paintings attained their consummation. In the private collection of Shri Narendra Singh Singhi of Calcutta, there is a manuscript of *Śālibhadracarita* illuminated by this artist with more than 20 paintings, some of which are of superb execution.

Jainism has thus significantly enriched Indian culture in the fields of ethics, philosophy, literature, science and æsthetics.

NATHMAL TATIA

---

1 Vol. XXI, No. 2, 1929
2 *Cf. La Religion Djaina.* By GUERINOT. P. 279.
3 I, p. 121.
4 *Jainism in North India.* By C. J. SHAH. P. 246.
5 *Studies in South Indian Jainism*, I, p. 77.
6 *Ibid.*, p. 79.
7 *Catalogue of the Indian Collections in the Museum of Fine Arts*, Boston, Part IV, p. 33.
8 *Ibid.*, p. 34.

ENDS AND SAYINGS

" _____ *ends of verse*
And sayings of philosophers."
HUDIBRAS

It was a memorable picture of a memorable woman that emerged from the speeches made at the Indian Institute of Culture, Basavangudi, Bangalore, on March 2nd, at a Special Meeting for the fourth anniversary of Shrimati Sarojini Naidu's death. Like Mayakovsky, Sarojini Devi "trod on the throat of her songs" for the love of her country, but her three books, *The Golden Threshold, The Bird of Time* and *The Broken Wing* bear enduring witness to her lyric power.

Prof. M. S. Doraiswamy, Principal of the Arts College of the Osmania University, Hyderabad, spoke on "Sarojini Devi—The Poet," and Dr. D. Gurumurti, on "Sarojini Devi—The Politician." The line of demarcation, however, could not be rigidly drawn. As was well brought out by the Chairman, Shri M. Narayana Rao, Principal of the Government Law College, she had shown poetry and statecraft to be not incompatible. Long after she had laid aside her poet's pen, she had enlivened even prosaic political meetings with a poetic touch.

As much as for her poetry and her patriotism, she will be remembered for the warmth of her human sympathy, for the cheeriness and courage that could rise above personal sorrow and bodily disabilities to enliven gatherings and to keep up the spirits of her fellow-prisoners, including Gandhiji, to whom her special devotion was given. All three participants in the meeting paid their tribute to "Sarojini—The Woman," who had worked not only for her country's freedom but also for the emancipation of Indian womanhood and for Hindu-Muslim unity and who was, perhaps above all else, a lover of her kind.

"Greater this and Greater that, but not a thought for Great *India.*" There is justice in this exclamation by the veteran Indian historian Dr. Jadunath Sarkar in his article, "Why Linguistic Provinces?" which appeared in *The Hindustan Standard* recently and has been given further publicity in the April *Modern Review.* The clamour for linguistic provinces has no such moral basis as Prohibition, wisely included in the Indian Constitution among the Directive Principles of State Policy. Prohibition is slowly but surely showing good results despite dilatory tactics and determined opposition, but linguistic provinces will not work.

Dr. Sarkar blames ambitious politicians for the present agitation, though the impetus was given towards the "Balkanization of India" in the policy adopted by Britain early in this century. Fair treatment to minority languages in each area is necessary, but the language diversity except in small areas makes unification on a basis of linguistic affinity impracticable, as he brings out.

He pleads for strengthening the unifying forces, to check the ominous momentum of the movement; for putting Federal paramountcy above State rights; for education on an All-India basis with English as the medium of instruction for future holders of high administrative posts; and, above all, for a change of hearts and for setting aside self-interest in the interest of "the basic oneness that is India."

"Is the American Economy Capitalist?" Dr. Henry C. Hart of the University of Wisconsin, in India as a Fulbright Scholar at the University of Mysore, considered this question at the Indian Institute of Culture, Bangalore,

on March 12th. Americans considered their economy capitalistic, but actually, Dr. Hart said, the Government policy had rather been pragmatic; the country acted in each situation as seemed best at the time. Judging by more than one criterion, he showed, India was more capitalistic than the U.S.A. The tendency to monopoly control was present, he admitted, but it was being watched; and, on the other side, there was profit-sharing by labour under the present wage scale; the high-income group was providing in income taxes much of the money used for the common benefit, etc.

Especially interesting was Dr. Hart's tracing of the rise of capitalism back to the Protestants' having sanctioned the taking of interest. From this had come diffusion of financial power, the bourgeois revolution, etc. The brotherhood of man had been accepted politically long before it was economically, but the hold of capitalism had been broken more and more in this century, when other countries' welfare had also assumed unprecedented importance in the U.S A.

The Chairman, Shri P. Kodanda Rao of the Servants of India Society, showed how, increasingly, the concept of absolute ownership of capital was giving place in the U.S.A. to that of trusteeship and service of the people. Socialism had come to America, but largely by private agreement, rather than by Governmental action, as in Britain.

The true note of democracy was sounded by Mr. Harold H. Fisher, Chairman of the Hoover Institute and Library of War, Revolution and Peace, in a lecture delivered last August at the Fourth Annual Summer Institute of the San Francisco State College, a copy of which we have just seen. Speaking on "India in the World Community," he was very sympathetic with Mr. Nehru's independent policy in international affairs. He believed that it might conceivably

> do more to discourage aggression, to uphold the right of national self-determination and to develop the world community on the basis of freedom than if India were to join a regional security agreement, linked up with NATO or ANZUS.

He suggested that India's history and traditions as well as her geographical location put her in an exceptionally good position for helping to find in world affairs a "third way" for dealing with clashes of immediate interests, a way which would be in the interest of world peace. Specifically he recognized that her not being formally allied with the "free world security system" left her free to maintain friendly relations with China, which he recognized as potentially valuable for world peace.

The history and culture of India and Asia, he said, had a great contribution to make to the great task of building a world community, a contribution which, he concluded, could be fully made "not under conditions of subservience or inferiority, but in freedom and equality."

The fundamental significance of the Korean question is well brought out by Mr. Rajaram V. Gogate, an American citizen of Indian descent, in "How India Looks at Korea" (*The Korean Survey*, U.S.A., February 1953). Conceding many inconsistencies in the Indian policy toward Korea, he pleads nevertheless for recognition of the sincerity of India's moral principles. Any real solution, he says, must make Korea "a symbol of holding back the tide of military aggression"; for

> unless to the solution of the Korean affair a moral basis is given, the whole disturbed and distraught world, especially the Asian world, must lose faith.

Mr. Gogate sees in Pandit Nehru's policy the recognition of the moral need to shift the emphasis from possible dire political consequences (with the strategic measures against which the U.S.A. is preoccupied) to safeguarding freedom and reconstructing ruins.